Leveraging Assets: Strategies to Spur Private Investment in Columbia Borough

An Urban Land Institute Technical Assistance Panel
April 24–25, 2019

Sponsored by Columbia Borough
The Urban Land Institute (ULI) was established in 1936 as a nonprofit educational and research institute and is supported by more than 40,000 members in 82 countries and representing all aspects of land use and development disciplines. ULI’s mission is to provide leadership in the responsible use of land in creating and sustaining thriving communities worldwide.

ULI provides guidance to nonprofits and municipalities seeking solutions to land use challenges. At the regional level, ULI Philadelphia offers Technical Assistance Panels (TAPs) that bring together objective planners, developers, lenders, architects and related professionals to evaluate specific needs and make recommendations on implementation in an atmosphere free of politics and preconceptions. ULI member and non-member professionals provide their expertise in a voluntary capacity and each has signed an agreement to avoid current or potential conflicts of interest.
Introduction

The Borough of Columbia in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania requested that ULI Philadelphia conduct a Technical Assistance Panel (TAP) to address the redevelopment of a group of vacant properties (305–315 Locust Street and adjoining properties at 25 N. 3rd, 300 and 316-320 Walnut streets; “the study area”) in its central business district to create “a needed anchor for the downtown and a catalyst for other redevelopment in the commercial core.”

The panel was charged with determining the potential for an infill or other type of mixed-use development to catalyze growth; investigating how the study area could be configured for maximum success; studying creative parking solutions; and suggesting the best structure and organization of roles among the existing partners to advance the project.

On April 24-25, 2019, the panel, comprised of urban planners, design and real estate professionals, developers and a mayor of a nearby Pennsylvania borough, conducted on-site visits and interviewed a broad range of stakeholders before presenting its findings and recommendations to a convening of stakeholders, residents, businesspeople and other interested parties.

The considerable assets that position Columbia Borough for growth and redevelopment underscore those findings and recommendations.

The panel’s key recommendations are aimed at optimizing the study area for future private investment and to position the borough for vitality and growth:

- Consolidate and market the study area properties through the Lancaster County Redevelopment Authority (LCRDA).
- Consider a hospitality use for the study area. Additional uses are discussed below and would contribute to growth in the central business district; however, the panel believes a hotel on Locust Street, between 305 and 315, would be the most effective catalyst for revitalizing the commercial core.
- Consider using marketing and placemaking techniques to brand the area around 3rd and Locust streets as the heart of the central business district.
- Commission a parking study to inventory existing supply and locations and gather essential data for a potential future parking structure in the central business district.
- In the short-term, make parking in the central business district more convenient with technology solutions, improved wayfinding and proactive communications.
- Consider raising on-street parking rates and create a paved, pay surface lot that would serve as a data point for future needs; dedicate revenues to a revolving parking fund.
- Enhance urban design and connectivity between the Susquehanna riverfront and the central business district to draw trail users.
Columbia Borough, population c.10,000, is located on the Susquehanna River, roughly halfway between the cities of York and Lancaster. It has a rich history and was considered for the site of the U.S. capital, later playing a pivotal role in the Underground Railroad and Civil War. A hub for canal transport, iron and steel making through the 19th century, Columbia experienced economic decline throughout much of the 20th and into the 21st century.

Despite its attractive riverfront location and historic features, today the Borough is faced with a low-income and often transient population, under-performing schools, a struggling commercial business district with a number of under-utilized, vacant and blighted buildings, and a shortage of basic retail and service businesses to serve its residents.

Nevertheless, a number of businesses are thriving and properties have successfully been redeveloped, notably Hinkle’s, a 100-year-old pharmacy that is now a gift shop and restaurant; the Columbia Kettle Works brewpub; the Café 301 coffee shop; Burning Bridge Antiques Market and the Perfect Settings event space. Local developer and community leader Cimarron Development has been a committed and successful entity in the redevelopment of many downtown properties and is currently at work on the proposed development of a hotel at the former Becker Chip Factory, a vacant industrial property located at 2nd and Locust streets.

In recent years, the Borough has also lined up a number of tools that have the potential to provide significant incentives for economic development. These include designation as a Keystone Opportunity Economic Zone (KOEZ), federal Opportunity Zone which extends through parts of the downtown including the subject properties, and the establishment of a local land bank. The Borough has also had success attracting funding through programs including Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance (LERTA) and Redevelopment Assistance Capital Program (RACP) grants.

The panel identified a number of key assets that position the Borough for growth. Foremost is its location, easily accessible to Harrisburg, Lancaster and York and along the Susquehanna River, with its picturesque riverfront recreation offerings and trails.

The Borough also has good investment potential and offers many attractive development opportunities. As mentioned, progressive Borough leadership has secured multiple county and state partners and achieved success in accessing economic development tools. Columbia 2040, an updated comprehensive plan, is currently underway, offering
a clear blueprint for guiding Columbia Borough into the future, while capitalizing on its friendly, small-town atmosphere, safety and cleanliness.

With its rich history and heritage, historic architecture and urban form, Columbia is well positioned to draw visitors. Its attractions include a thriving antiques sector, the Turkey Hill Experience, the National Watch and Clock Museum, and, imminently, the opening of the historic Columbia Market House.

At the same time, the panel identified challenges facing the Borough. It is especially critical that the Borough work to balance economic development and investment to meet resident and visitor needs, especially to generate jobs and continue to bring essential retail and services, vitality and diversity to the central business district. This will require establishing public economic development strategies with a focus on long-term planning and infrastructure investment, embracing fresh perspectives, rehabilitating and diversifying the housing stock, generating tax ratables to support the school district and stabilizing the transient population.

Despite its challenges, downtown Columbia is home to a number of thriving businesses, some long-established like Hinkle’s Restaurant and Burning Bridge Antiques Market and newer ventures including Café 301 and the Columbia Kettle Works brewpub.
Assessment and Recommendations:

Subject Properties

The panel was charged with considering redevelopment opportunities for a site anchored by the former Hotel Locust and Hotel Columbia parcels, in the heart of the central business district, within an area roughly bounded by Locust Street, North 3rd Street and Walnut Street (“the study area”).

The parcels within the scope of the study area are:

• 305 Locust Street, private ownership
• 307 Locust Street, 1,936 SF, vacant commercial building built in 1900 with ground-floor retail space owned by a private entity.
• 309 Locust Street, 13,639 SF, the now-vacant site of the Hotel Columbia with ground-floor retail space, built in 1900, owned by Columbia Economic Development Corp.
• 315 Locust Street, 8,917 SF, the now-vacant site of the Hotel Locust, with ground-floor retail space, built in 1892, owned by Columbia Economic Development Corp.
• 25 N. 3rd Street, a .35-acre vacant lot, used for parking by the adjacent Burning Bridge Antiques Market, the property owner.
• 300 Walnut Street
• 316 Walnut Street, a .13-acre vacant lot, owned by Burning Bridge Antiques Market.
• 318 Walnut Street
• 320 Walnut Street

Top: Columbia Borough charged the TAP with considering redevelopment opportunities for these parcels in the heart of its central business district: 300 Walnut Street, 25 N. 3rd Street, 316 – 320 Walnut Street, 318 Walnut Street, 305-309 Locust and 315 Locust Street.
Bottom: 315 Locust Street, former Hotel Locust.
Existing Conditions

309 Locust Street.

315 Locust Street.

316 Walnut Street

The interiors of the two former hotel properties are severely deteriorated.

318-320 Walnut Street
Study Area Site Options: Generating Private Investment

The panel considered multiple options for the redevelopment and configuration of the properties within the study area, currently all vacant or underutilized. All of the options explored by the panelists are intended to generate continued activity and improve vibrancy in the central business district. After considering many options, the panel felt that a hotel would be the catalytic project that the Borough is seeking to revitalize its commercial core.

Returning the two historic buildings at 309 and 315 Locust Street in the heart of the central business district to their original use as hotels – either by repurposing the existing structures or retaining and capitalizing on their attractive, historic facades – could have multiple positive impacts. By drawing tourists and visitors into the central business district and promoting overnight stays, a hotel at this location could generate foot traffic and leverage a critical mass of ancillary, nearby businesses to serve both visitors and residents. Among the desired uses identified in stakeholder interviews are restaurants and bars, grocery stores, dry cleaners, clothing and shoe stores, laundromats, fitness facilities and a theater; all of which would benefit from having a hotel nearby.

A hotel would also reinforce the connection between the central business district and Columbia Crossing on the nearby Susquehanna riverfront, drawing upon the 90,000 -100,000 annual users who jog, hike, bike and cross-country ski along the riverfront trail. Another market would be the 20,000 – 30,000 annual antique shoppers who converge on Columbia on the weekends.

The panel carefully evaluated a proposal to preserve the historic hotel facades and redevelop the properties as a mixed-use project with ground-floor commercial and market-rate or luxury residential on a parking podium. From a retail perspective, there is currently a considerable supply of vacant retail sites on either side of the study area. The necessary and consistent retail users and projected rents required to generate private interest in this type of mixed-use deal are currently not present in this market, therefore making this use difficult.

While bringing residences to the central business district would be beneficial, the panel concluded that this use would not provide the transformational anchor that the Borough seeks as residential use is currently strong with several projects underway or planned. The panel expressed concern whether a private developer would feel confident in the data to demonstrate sufficient demand for luxury or market-rate apartments in the central business district.

The panel also contemplated another option: build two levels of new apartments along Walnut Street above a parking podium and retain the historic hotel facades on Locust Street for a modest, mixed-use structure with surface parking or open space behind. Under this configuration, most of the new residences would face Walnut Street, which already has a residential character. The panel concluded that this approach, while potentially benefitting the central business district by drawing a residential population and redeveloping the study area, would not create as significant catalytic anchor as the proposed hotel structure.

Regardless of the eventual use, the TAP concluded that it is not economically viable at this time to build a multi-level parking structure at the site and that a parking garage will not contribute to, or in itself, constitute a transformational central business district project.

Instead, the TAP recommends that the Borough build, operate and closely monitor a c.70-space, surface, pay parking lot at 25 N. 3rd Street to provide public parking, generate revenue, provide a viable option for residents and visitors and gather data on parking demand for future consideration. A parking podium beneath the structures as proposed could serve any hotel, commercial, or residential components built on the surrounding parcels.
Site Consolidation and Marketing

The TAP recommends that the study area parcels be assembled into a single development site to allow the most flexibility and, in the future, the possible construction of a parking garage. The Lancaster County Redevelopment Authority (LCRDA) should move to acquire, consolidate and market the properties as a single development opportunity. The LCRDA is best positioned to provide professional services relating to site assembly, environmental assessments and remediation, parking solutions and incentives including RACP grants (for parking) and KOEZ and federal Opportunity Zone benefits, among others, in order to attract optimal, private redevelopment. Unified site control is especially critical to attract development partners and to accommodate any future parking structure.

To further enliven the central business district and create a common center, consider branding the area at and around the intersection of 3rd and Locust streets as the town center (eg. “Columbia Square” or “Columbia Center”). Placemaking tools that should be considered include banners, signage (noting the rich historical information), art, lighting, crosswalk painting or decorative pavers, landscaping, and a small “pocket park.” Adding bike racks will make this an appealing and easily accessible focal point for local residents as well as visitors coming from the river.

The identity and visibility of this central location should be further reinforced in Borough marketing and on its website. A thriving central square will enhance all aspects of the borough and draw traffic to local businesses.

Parking

The stakeholder interviews demonstrated no clear consensus on parking. Some stakeholders expressed the opinion that there is ample, available parking in Columbia Borough; others identified a multi-level parking structure as a pressing need.

The panel concluded that construction of a parking garage is not economically viable now at the study area or elsewhere in the central business district, but should be reassessed every few years.

The panel’s conclusion is based on the following analysis of a standard, three-level structure and the traffic necessary to support the cost:

A three-level structure with 64 spaces per level would require a 20,000-square-foot floor plate, necessitating the acquisition of two additional properties along Walnut Street. The cost to build structured parking is c.$30,000 per parking spot or nearly $6 million total. Assuming c.$30,000 the Borough was successful in getting a $3 million RACP matching grant, construction of a 192-space garage would require a $3 million loan. Carrying costs on a 30-year, four-percent-interest-rate loan would equal about $15,000 per month. Utilities, insurance and other expenses would bring that monthly total to about $22,000. Assuming a modest parking charge of $2 per hour, it would require 200 unique visitors for two hours every day to generate enough monthly income to cover the costs of debt service and operations described above (see appendix).

Instead, the TAP recommends that the Borough implement a series of short-term and interim parking management solutions, several of them immediately feasible, that would improve parking conditions, generate revenue and encourage private development. These recommendations leave open development potential for a parking structure in the future if deemed necessary and profitable for an entity to undertake.

These short-term or interim recommendations include:

Commission a parking study and analysis as an essential first step, which is already an ongoing priority in the Columbia 2040 comprehensive plan that is underway. An inventory is needed to provide an authoritative count of the amount and location of existing parking in the Borough and what is supportable from a finance and operating perspective.
Such a study should assess the current capacity of residential units and the square footage of commercial units to determine need as well as the supply and use of municipal spaces.

Build and operate a c. 70-space, paved, gated, pay, surface parking lot at 25 N. 3rd Street. Monitor and collect reliable data over several years to determine demand for an eventual parking structure at the site. This would accommodate any current needs, generate revenue and provide automated information for the Borough regarding parking patterns.

To make central business district parking more immediately convenient and user friendly, introduce modern parking technology. Panelists heard feedback about the current cumbersome system that impacts local business today. A number of apps are available that allow users to pay for and extend their parking stay on their smartphones. A further customer-service enhancement would be to install parking kiosks that accept credit cards. Such low-cost technologies would eliminate the need for those parking to search for quarters to feed the meters and should be implemented as quickly as possible.

Improve communications to residents and visitors by adding updated parking information and a map of public parking lots on the Borough website. The panel heard feedback about under-utilized lots with proximity to retail. A comprehensive wayfinding system of directional signs should be created to direct drivers to nearby surface parking lots in the central business district.

Create a dedicated, revolving parking fund rather than put the money in a general fund to give the Borough flexibility in funding both short- and long-term parking innovations, infrastructure and maintenance.

To raise revenue, increase on-street parking meter rates (currently only 50 cents per hour).

Implement a system of parking permits and parking passes. Long-term, cost-effective residential and commercial parking permits for designated areas and daily parking passes for tourists and other visitors (at a higher rate) to the central business district would raise revenue and make parking easier and more convenient. Provide a parking discount for local residents.

As mentioned above, a secure, pay surface lot at 25 N. 3rd Street will generate revenue and provide data to determine demand for a parking structure. The Borough should also continue to pursue RACP grants, which could be used to fund parking of any type.

Amend zoning regulations to reduce parking requirements. The Borough’s current zoning code requires two parking spaces per residential unit and a set number of spaces based on commercial square footage. The panel determined that these parking minimums are unnecessarily dense and could be a constraint on private development. The Borough should consider amending its zoning code and, in the interim, continue to grant variances and allow developers to make payments in lieu of meeting parking minimums. The additional recommendations listed above would simultaneously address and measure parking demand.

The panel’s longer-term parking recommendations include:

Monitor and collect data about parking usage at the N. 3rd Street lot, at meters and through permits and passes.

After several years, reevaluate the need for a parking structure at 25 N. 3rd Street or elsewhere in the central business district. Any such determination should, at a minimum, carefully balance garage construction with development incentives, the potential loss of architectural fabric, and availability of RACP grants and other funding. Future requirements for the study area should also consider location of parking with respect to alternative uses, such as development or civic space, that are creating vitality and foot traffic. A parking structure should not be the leading, catalytic development opportunity.

Urban Design and Connectivity

Although the Borough did not specify these issues in the scope, the panel identified additional considerations that could greatly benefit the central business district and enhance their recommendations generated by the original scope questions. Many of these steps are recommended in the Borough’s previous master and economic development plans, and the panel further supports these concepts.

The picturesque and historic riverfront and the modern visitor and events facilities at the Columbia Crossing River Trails Center, operated by Susquehanna Heritage, are major assets that should be further optimized. Nearly 100,000 outdoor enthusiasts use the riverside trail annually, representing a potential market for the existing high-quality restaurants, shops and, conceivably, an anchor hotel in the central business district, only one-third of a mile, or a two-minute walk, away.
The TAP undertook an “extra credit” assignment to suggest how improved connectivity to the nearby riverfront could bring activity to the downtown.

Columbia’s picturesque and historic riverfront is a major asset that can be better leveraged.

The panel recommends that the Borough undertake a series of traffic, streetscape and wayfinding improvements to create a “gateway” and an attractive corridor linking the central business district and the riverfront.

At present, Walnut Street, which is largely residential, is the primary connector between the central business district and the trail. The Borough should divert trail users to Locust Street, which leads directly into the commercial core.

Several tactics should be considered. A longer term idea to make Walnut and Locust streets one way would establish Locust Street as the primary link to downtown from the river and would calm traffic on both streets. Another option would be to eliminate one lane of parking on each street to allow for a bicycle lane.

Streetscape improvements, that build on existing plans, including bright decorative lighting, street trees, planters and other landscaping, painted bicycle lanes and new sidewalks would all contribute to appealing pedestrian and cyclist connections between the riverfront and central business district.

Additional opportunities to clean, green and transform Bank Avenue and Avenue H into a bicycle/pedestrian corridor between the riverfront and the central business district would enliven streets and generate activity.

A wayfinding system, part of the comprehensive system recommended above, should provide clear directions to the central business district, to parking (both automotive and bicycle), and to other attractions in the Borough and back to the riverfront. A bike and walking trail that goes through the Borough, as has been done in nearby riverfront communities such as Marietta Borough, should be considered.

At the riverfront, a high-visibility gateway should orient and welcome trail users to Columbia Borough and the town center at 3rd and Locust streets. Possibilities include a structure or large mural on North Front Street.
Summary

Columbia Borough has great potential for redevelopment by drawing on its many assets. Many of the panel’s short-term and interim recommendations can begin to address the challenges faced by the Borough’s central business district, notably parking and drawing foot traffic and businesses.

Over the longer term, the panel suggests a measured, data-driven approach to evaluating parking needs and giving thoughtful consideration to redevelopment of the Locust/Walnut/North 3rd street sites. By consolidating the subject properties into a single development opportunity, the Borough can maximize private investment and leverage those exciting assets for long-term economic vibrancy throughout the central business district.

Making Locust and Walnut streets one-way and diverting trail users to Locust would draw them downtown to eat or shop.
Panelists

Rick Jackson, Co-Chair  
VP, Landscape Architecture, ELA Group, Inc.  

Rick Jackson is Vice President of Landscape Architecture at ELA Group, Inc., with offices in Lititz, State College, and Butler (PA). A 1979 graduate of the Pennsylvania State University (BS: Landscape Architecture), Rick received his professional registration in 1983 from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. He is also registered to practice in the State of Maryland. In his 40 years of professional experience, Rick has represented clients’ projects ranging from commercial/industrial to residential, institutional to recreational. While primarily working in the private sector, he represents the public sector as well. Currently, Rick serves as President of the Board of the Lancaster Housing Opportunity Partnership and is Co-Chair of LHOP’s Coalition for Sustainable Housing, advocating for housing affordability. He also serves on the Governing Board of the Lancaster County Coalition to End Homelessness, the Board of the Lancaster County Convention Center Authority, and as Vice President of the Board of Trustees of Moravian Manors, Inc.

Josh Maxwell, Co-Chair  
Mayor of Downingtown, Borough of Downingtown  

Josh Maxwell is in his third term as the mayor of Downingtown after being sworn in as Downingtown’s youngest Mayor in 2010 at the age of 26. Maxwell has focused on urban redevelopment, improving the tax-base, and personalizing the role of Mayor during his tenure. In 2017, Maxwell negotiated the largest public and private investment in Downingtown’s history - a $224 million transit-oriented development that includes an Amtrak/Septa station and trail extension that increases the value of the community by 17%. Downingtown has gone one of the largest stretches for a Chester County borough without a tax increase and has paid down more than 60% of its debt during his tenure. Maxwell holds a Bachelor’s Degree from West Chester University and a Masters in Public Administration from the University of Pennsylvania.

Dylan Bauer  
President of Development, Royal Square Development  

Dylan’s job is to visualize, develop, and implement real estate development opportunities. While much of his time is focused on building relationships and developing a bigger vision for the company, he maintains a position as an active member of the downtown community. Dylan’s local knowledge, community connections and real estate experience are an asset to the RSDC team. With a Bachelor’s degree in Entrepreneurship, Dylan owned his own company for the better part of 8 years before becoming a commercial real estate brokerage advisor. It was then that he realized his passion for revitalizing York City.

Jonathan Bowser  
Managing Partner, Integrated Development  

Innovative, strategic leader, skilled in planning, organizing and implementing economic development functions from conception to completion, including complex real estate projects, business retention, business attraction and incentive programs, to foster community growth and development. Proven track record of devising and implementing strategies to create jobs, improve military relations, promote workforce development and improve quality of life. Strong background in relationship management, team building, and driving profitability gains and revenues.

Brian Engle  
Vice President, RETTEW  

Mr. Engle is a Regional Vice President at RETTEW and has 25 years of experience serving as project manager and principal-in-charge for private and municipal clients. He has extensive experience in municipal engineering, master site planning, zoning, land development, stormwater management, E&S control, utility design, and construction management. In his role as Regional Vice President, he is instrumental in furthering RETTEW’s mission through collaboration and relationship-building with clients and business partners. Mr. Engle maintains high levels of client contact and is continually looking for opportunities to leverage RETTEW’s resources and strategically broaden the firm’s portfolio of services to increase client satisfaction. He also works closely with staff in a mentoring and coaching capacity to ensure quality project delivery and strong client relationships.

H. Stephen Evans  
SVP & Managing Director, High Real Estate Group  

H. Stephen Evans is Senior Vice President and Managing Director of the Retail Division for High Real Estate Group, LLC. He launched and has led the retail division within High Real Estate Group since 2002 and is responsible for guiding High’s retail development efforts and management of its shopping center portfolio. A retail real estate specialist with over 40 years in the industry, prior to High, Mr. Evans served as Senior Vice President, Real Estate, Legal and Government Affairs for York, PA-based The Bon-Ton Department Stores, Inc. and with the Real Estate Department of JC Penney Company, Inc., serving in various positions in New York, Los Angeles, and Pittsburgh.

A member of the Florida Bar, Mr. Evans holds a B.A. in Political Science from Drew University and a J.D. from Stetson University College of Law. Mr. Evans is an active member of the International Council of Shopping Centers (ICSC) and the Urban Land Institute (ULI). Mr. Evans serves on the Board of Trustees (Past President) of The Janus School in Mt. Joy, PA.

Michel Gibeault, AIA, Vice President, High Construction Co. & Greenfield Architects  

Michel Gibeault has more 40 years of experience spanning all facets of project development, from concept through construction. He worked on the client-side as director of development; he served as an architect and director of operations for an architectural firm; and he oversaw operations of a construction/architectural firm. As vice president of business development for High Construction, Michel has guided more than 120 projects through planning, design, and construction. Michel also serves as Chairperson for the Manheim Township Planning Commission, a position he has held for 14 years. In addition, he is Chairman of the Board of Directors for Housing Development Corporation MidAtlantic, a non-profit affordable housing developer. Michel is also an associate member of ULI Philadelphia.
Rachael Griffith  
Senior Trails and Open Space Planner, Chester County Planning Commission  
Rachael Griffith is a planner and PA-registered landscape architect with experience in the public, private and non-profit sectors. She currently serves as a Senior Trails and Open Space Planner at the Chester County Planning Commission where she is responsible for project management of trail feasibility studies, as well as coordination with and technical support for municipalities to build and connect their trail systems to the broader network. Rachael has experience in creative community engagement, capacity building and strategic planning to efficiently implement projects with maximum buy-in. Rachael's passion for "getting things done" has led her to pursue a Masters degree in Public Administration at the Fels Institute of Government of the University of Pennsylvania with a focus on public finance and economic development.

Harshil Kakadia  
Architectural Designer, Le Blue Goose Studio  
Harshil Kakadia is the lead Architectural Designer and Owner of Le Blue Goose Studio. He pursued his bachelors from Temple University and Masters in Architecture from New School of Architecture + Design. He admires the design process more than the end result and pays very close attention to details. In addition to residential projects, Harshil has worked on numerous commercial projects and hotels all around the world. His abroad studies in Buenos Aires, India, China, Barcelona and Rome as well as his domestic studies in Philadelphia and San Diego have shaped his view of the world in architecture and interior design. Outside of the studio, Harshil enjoys aviation, playing sports, crossfit, surfing, skiing, hiking or anything related to the great outdoors.

Brian Simel  
Former Director of Development, Cross Properties  
Brian Simel has worked in a variety of real estate roles in Southeastern Pennsylvania and beyond. He began his career as a consultant using data driven analytics to help Fortune 500 retailers make network and site selection decisions in a more rigorous way. He would go on to work in various roles over the following years, including with Crescent Communities as an Associate on the Commercial and Mixed-Use Development team, with Streamline Solutions on the Acquisitions team, and most recently with Cross Properties as Director of Project Development. Brian graduated from Duke University with a Bachelor of Science in Economics and Computer Science, and later earned his MBA from The Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania.

Ronald Street  
Managing Director, NorthStar Owners Representation  
During his 35+ years of experience, Ron has undertaken a myriad of roles from Construction Manager, to Engineer, to Real Estate Developer to name a few. With his 2 former partners, he started NorthStar with those perspectives and applied them to the business model and approach in order to carry out the true goal of an owner’s representation – to provide extensive and varied experience to enhance the client’s project process and final result. In his role as Managing Director and Principal, Ron is the keeper of quality control and company expectations. With his expansive range and years of experience, he’s able to ensure that each of NorthStar’s projects is managed at the highest level possible and that each NorthStar Principal is integrally involved in every project. Since NorthStar’s inception in 1999, though Ron is ultimately owner, he has taken on central roles in all of the 1,000+ projects that NorthStar has managed.

Stakeholder Participants

Cle Berntheizel, Councilperson; Owner, Columbia Borough Council; Garth Gallery & Café  
John Biemiller, Director, Business Retention & Expansion, Economic Development Company of Lancaster County  
Nate Bunty, Managing Partner, Heritage Insurance  
Hope Byers, Manager of Columbia Crossing River Trails Center, Susquehanna Heritage  
Althea Ramsay Carrigan, Vice President, BURLE Business Park  
Larry Cohen, Executive Director, Lancaster Parking Authority  
Justin Eby, Director, Housing and Community Development, Lancaster County Redevelopment Authority  
Phil Goropoulos, President, CHI St. Joseph Children’s Health / Healthy Columbia  
Jeff Helm, Planning & Zoning Manager, Columbia Borough  
Bob Herr, Owner, Burning Bridge Antiques  
Bill Kloidt, Branch Manager, BB&T  
Leo Lutz, Mayor, Columbia Borough  
Brian McCowan, Board President, Susquehanna Valley Chamber of Commerce  
Kelsey Miller, Program Manager, CHI St. Joseph Children’s Health / Healthy Columbia  
Rachael Griffith  
Former Director of Development, Cross Properties  
Brian Simel has worked in a variety of real estate roles in Southeastern Pennsylvania and beyond. He began his career as a consultant using data driven analytics to help Fortune 500 retailers make network and site selection decisions in a more rigorous way. He would go on to work in various roles over the following years, including with Crescent Communities as an Associate on the Commercial and Mixed-Use Development team, with Streamline Solutions on the Acquisitions team, and most recently with Cross Properties as Director of Project Development. Brian graduated from Duke University with a Bachelor of Science in Economics and Computer Science, and later earned his MBA from The Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania.

Ronald Street  
Managing Director, NorthStar Owners Representation  
During his 35+ years of experience, Ron has undertaken a myriad of roles from Construction Manager, to Engineer, to Real Estate Developer to name a few. With his 2 former partners, he started NorthStar with those perspectives and applied them to the business model and approach in order to carry out the true goal of an owner’s representation – to provide extensive and varied experience to enhance the client’s project process and final result. In his role as Managing Director and Principal, Ron is the keeper of quality control and company expectations. With his expansive range and years of experience, he’s able to ensure that each of NorthStar’s projects is managed at the highest level possible and that each NorthStar Principal is integrally involved in every project. Since NorthStar’s inception in 1999, though Ron is ultimately owner, he has taken on central roles in all of the 1,000+ projects that NorthStar has managed.

Stakeholder Participants

Cle Berntheizel, Councilperson; Owner, Columbia Borough Council; Garth Gallery & Café  
John Biemiller, Director, Business Retention & Expansion, Economic Development Company of Lancaster County  
Nate Bunty, Managing Partner, Heritage Insurance  
Hope Byers, Manager of Columbia Crossing River Trails Center, Susquehanna Heritage  
Althea Ramsay Carrigan, Vice President, BURLE Business Park  
Larry Cohen, Executive Director, Lancaster Parking Authority  
Justin Eby, Director, Housing and Community Development, Lancaster County Redevelopment Authority  
Phil Goropoulos, President, CHI St. Joseph Children’s Health / Healthy Columbia  
Jeff Helm, Planning & Zoning Manager, Columbia Borough  
Bob Herr, Owner, Burning Bridge Antiques  
Bill Kloidt, Branch Manager, BB&T  
Leo Lutz, Mayor, Columbia Borough  
Brian McCowan, Board President, Susquehanna Valley Chamber of Commerce  
Kelsey Miller, Program Manager, CHI St. Joseph Children’s Health / Healthy Columbia  
Rachael Griffith  
Former Director of Development, Cross Properties  
Brian Simel has worked in a variety of real estate roles in Southeastern Pennsylvania and beyond. He began his career as a consultant using data driven analytics to help Fortune 500 retailers make network and site selection decisions in a more rigorous way. He would go on to work in various roles over the following years, including with Crescent Communities as an Associate on the Commercial and Mixed-Use Development team, with Streamline Solutions on the Acquisitions team, and most recently with Cross Properties as Director of Project Development. Brian graduated from Duke University with a Bachelor of Science in Economics and Computer Science, and later earned his MBA from The Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania.

Ronald Street  
Managing Director, NorthStar Owners Representation  
During his 35+ years of experience, Ron has undertaken a myriad of roles from Construction Manager, to Engineer, to Real Estate Developer to name a few. With his 2 former partners, he started NorthStar with those perspectives and applied them to the business model and approach in order to carry out the true goal of an owner’s representation – to provide extensive and varied experience to enhance the client’s project process and final result. In his role as Managing Director and Principal, Ron is the keeper of quality control and company expectations. With his expansive range and years of experience, he’s able to ensure that each of NorthStar’s projects is managed at the highest level possible and that each NorthStar Principal is integrally involved in every project. Since NorthStar’s inception in 1999, though Ron is ultimately owner, he has taken on central roles in all of the 1,000+ projects that NorthStar has managed.

Stakeholder Participants

Cle Berntheizel, Councilperson; Owner, Columbia Borough Council; Garth Gallery & Café  
John Biemiller, Director, Business Retention & Expansion, Economic Development Company of Lancaster County  
Nate Bunty, Managing Partner, Heritage Insurance  
Hope Byers, Manager of Columbia Crossing River Trails Center, Susquehanna Heritage  
Althea Ramsay Carrigan, Vice President, BURLE Business Park  
Larry Cohen, Executive Director, Lancaster Parking Authority  
Justin Eby, Director, Housing and Community Development, Lancaster County Redevelopment Authority  
Phil Goropoulos, President, CHI St. Joseph Children’s Health / Healthy Columbia  
Jeff Helm, Planning & Zoning Manager, Columbia Borough  
Bob Herr, Owner, Burning Bridge Antiques  
Bill Kloidt, Branch Manager, BB&T  
Leo Lutz, Mayor, Columbia Borough  
Brian McCowan, Board President, Susquehanna Valley Chamber of Commerce  
Kelsey Miller, Program Manager, CHI St. Joseph Children’s Health / Healthy Columbia
### Columbia Borough Parking Garage Proforma

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Parking Spaces Per Level</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Levels</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Parking Spaces</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking SF Per Level</td>
<td>20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking SF Total</td>
<td>60,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price Per Parking Space</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking Garage Hard Cost</td>
<td>$5,760,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking Garage Soft Cost</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acquisition Cost</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Cost for Project</strong></td>
<td><strong>$6,060,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Capital Stack
- Bond / Private: $3,000,000
- RACP Grant Match: $3,000,000
- Total: $6,000,000

#### Annual Costs
- Mortgage Payment: $171,870 (3M, 4% Int., 30 Yr.)
- Utilities, Insurance: $60,000 ($1.00/SF Estimate)
- Maintenance Fund: $30,000 ($0.50/SF Reserve Fund)
- **Total Annual Cost**: $261,870
- **Total Monthly Cost**: $21,822

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Leased Spaces</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Rentable Spaces</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Passes</td>
<td>$1,440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost Per Month</td>
<td>$50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Month 20%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue Per Visit</td>
<td>$4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Required Number of Daily Visits</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Revenue (Hourly)</td>
<td>$800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Revenue (Hourly)</td>
<td>$22,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Revenue</td>
<td>$268,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Revenue (Combined)</td>
<td>$23,840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Expenses</td>
<td>$21,822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NET INCOME/LOSS</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2,018</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Based on Expenses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Annual Cost</td>
<td>$261,870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Monthly Cost</strong></td>
<td><strong>$21,822</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Available Spaces to Rent</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unique Visits / Day</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days of The Month</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Visits</td>
<td>2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue</td>
<td>$8,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$ / Per Hour</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours Per Unique Visit</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Monthly Cost</td>
<td>$21,822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projected Monthly Revenue</td>
<td>$14,976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NET INCOME/LOSS</strong></td>
<td><strong>($6,846)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>