### SUSTAINABLE PARKING STRATEGIES FOR CITY OF DECATUR





Serving Georgia, Alabama, and Eastern Tennessee

# **Client Objectives**

City of Decatur – Parking Strategies Implications Legal Financial Marketability Sustainability





# **Community Feedback**

#### **ROUND TABLES COMMENTS WORDLE**

This graphic represents the raw comments compiled from all three Round Table sessions. It shows both what defines Decatur and what participants hope for the future. The relative size of the word reflects the number of times it was mentioned.



# **Community Takeaways**

COMMUNITY ACADEMI	ES SUMMARY		
	What Did We Learn?	How Did This Shape The Plan?	Communit Academy
Going Mobile	<ul> <li>A connected transportation system is important</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>New street and other connections could benefit Decatur and future growth</li> </ul>	Academy
	<ul> <li>Vehicular traffic is an ongoing concern</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Appropriate design can slow cars in a neighborhood-sensitive way</li> </ul>	Exploring ways to help Decatur flourish.
×	<ul> <li>A circulator shuttle could build on existing transit</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Circulator viability study incorporated into recommended tasks</li> </ul>	adda 🔁
	<ul> <li>Parking is expensive to build and can sit unused</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Guided discussion toward ways to maximize use of existing parking</li> </ul>	
Decatur for Life	<ul> <li>Decatur is aging and becoming less diverse</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Diversity, housing, and affordability efforts will be key</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Affordable and accessible housing types are limited</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Code changes can help promote more variety and affordability</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Proximity and access to daily needs is crucial</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Infill growth can help provide services near each resident</li> </ul>	
The New Main Street	<ul> <li>Property taxes fall dispropor- tionately on residences</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Infill development, annexation, and business recruitment may add balance</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Retail needs more population to be viable</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Residential infill may help attract desired services</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Quality of life can attract a niche of employers</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Offices and non-traditional employers could be targeted to enhance the tax base</li> </ul>	
Getting The Love We Want	<ul> <li>Commercial development includ- ing high density residential projects pays taxes but uses few services</li> </ul>	Commercial and mixed-use residential developments may be targeted to increase the tax base	
	<ul> <li>Community amenities can drive up development costs</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Community desires should be balanced with development economics</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>Design and transitions can allow appropriate infill</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Standards could help ensure better context-sensitive infill development</li> </ul>	



## Parking Inventory and Policy Study

### Parking Inventory and Policy Study (2009)

Masters' thesis by a student at Georgia Tech

Four surveys were conducted to analyze existing parking facilities, conditions, needs and habits.

#### **Current inventory:**

300 on-street metered parking spaces
8,885 parking spaces within 70 parking lots

At least 41 parking lots (3,412 spaces) are customer, employee and/or resident restricted

Recommendations from study consistent with previously adopted **Community Transportation Plan** 







## PRINCIPLE A: MANAGE GROWTH WHILE RETAINING CHARACTER

Accommodate commercial and residential growth while retaining Decatur's unique sense of place within an urban environment

GOAL 1: RETAIN AND ENHANCE THE CHARACTER OF EXISTING COMMERCIAL DISTRICTS AND EXPAND IT TO NEW DISTRICTS

#### Task 1A Refine citywide commercial design standards

Design standards should be refined to support quality commercial and mixeduse growth. These should recognize the unique character and scale of Decatur's neighborhoods and avoid one-size-fits-all approaches. Updated standards for utility burial, architectural design, and parking should be explored as part of these refinements.







## PRINCIPLE C: SERVE AS GOOD STEWARDS OF THE ENVIRONMENT AND COMMUNITY RESOURCES

Practice fiscal, environmental and organizational stewardship to make efficient use of finite resources through collaboration and conservation.

GOAL 9: EXPAND AND DIVERSIFY THE CITY'S RESOURCE BASE

#### Task 9C

Support the redevelopment of surface parking lots and underperforming properties in the Downtown and Oakhurst commercial districts, and the development of the former DeVry University Property and East Decatur Station area with a mix of uses that meet community needs and help accomplish the community's vision.







#### PRINCIPLE D: SUPPORT A SAFE, HEALTHY, LIFELONG COMMUNITY

Assure that housing, mobility and support services exist to provide everyone at every age a high quality of life.

#### GOAL 14: ENHANCE MOBILITY OPTIONS WITHIN AND TO DECATUR

#### Task 14H

Update parking standards to allow innovative parking strategies, such as shared or unbundled parking, that create pedestrian friendly, environmentally sustainable and affordable developments.







#### PRINCIPLE D: SUPPORT A SAFE, HEALTHY, LIFELONG COMMUNITY

Assure that housing, mobility and support services exist to provide everyone at every age a high quality of life.

GOAL 15: EXPAND THE VARIETY OF HIGH QUALITY HOUSING OPTIONS TO MEET THE NEEDS OF A DIVERSE COMMUNITY

#### Task 15E

Support comprehensive efforts that go beyond the cost of rent and home price to keep Decatur affordable. The true cost of housing should also consider factors such as transportation, utility and maintenance costs. Strategies aimed at reducing car ownership and parking, increasing energy efficiency and buildings that are built to last can lower the cost of living.



## **Conceptual Growth Plan**

#### DOWNTOWN DECATUR CONCEPTUAL GROWTH PLAN



ULI Urban Land Atlanta Institute Serving Georgia, Alabama, and Eastern Tennessee

# Legal Considerations

## No current legal restrictions (at the state level) on: Parking Maximums Shared Parking Unbundled Parking



## Parking Maximums

## Definition: Establishes Upper Limit on Parking Supply

## Advantages:

- Increases Tax Revenue Through Redevelopment of Parking Lots
- Increases Availability of Affordable Housing

### Drawbacks:

- Shortage of Spaces Leads to Spillover Effects
- May Create Competitive Disadvantage

# Parking Maximums

### Solutions:

- Use as Part of Overlay District
- Residential Permit Parking Program
- Charge for On-Street Parking
- Allow Parking Entitlements to be Transferable or Owners to Pay Fee in Lieu of Providing Parking

### National Examples:

- Greater Boston Area Minimums and Maximums
- Boston/Portland/Seattle/San Francisco Freeze or Cap on Downtown Parking
- Ipswich, Mass.- No Parking Requirement for Developments in CBD
- Salem, Mass. No Parking Requirement for Churches





### Definition: Parking Facility Serves Multiple Destinations & User Types

## Advantages:

- Reduces overall level of spaces needed
- Promotes Sustainability

### Drawbacks:

- Clash of Residential and Commercial Uses
- Agreements can be Limiting as Property Evolves



#### ULI Urban Land Institute

## **Shared Parking**

### Solutions:

- Avoid using for Residential Properties (or limit applicability)
- Build Flexibility into Agreements
- Make Ordinance Permissive instead of Mandatory

### National Examples:

Greater Boston Area

- Allow Shared Parking for Uses with Different Peak Periods (Cut Required Minimums by Half)
- Provide Timetable of Parking Requirements by Use

Portland – Model Shared Parking Ordinance – Not Mandatory

(Shared Parking shall be considered when. . .)



# Unbundled Parking

### Definition: Separating Cost of Parking form Purchase Price of Property

## Advantages:

- Reduction in Costs Results in More Affordable Housing
- Promotes Sustainability by Encouraging Car Ownership

### Drawbacks:

- People Averse to "Paying" for Parking which leads to "Spillover Effects"
- Difficult to Implement in Commercial Contexts



# Unbundled Parking

## Solutions:

Prohibit overnight on-street parking or require residents to have permit to park

## National Examples:

San Francisco – Limited parking in downtown neighborhoods to 0.75 spaces per residential unit

Mass. Transit-Oriented Development Bond Program – Unbundled parking and limited to 0.7 spaces per unit



# **Financial Considerations**



## Existing Parking Requirements Stakeholder Interviews Project Cost Savings



## Existing Parking Requirements

Below is a table which reflects the current zoning requirements of the City of Decatur for new product introduced to the Planning Commission as found in Section 8.1 of the Decatur Zoning Ordinance.

Single Family Dwellings	1 space per Dwelling Unit
Townhouses/high density single-family dwellings	1.5 spaces per unit
High rise residential / RMH District	1 space per unit
Senior Housing	1 space per 2.25 units
General Retail	1 space per 200 square feet
General office including government	1 space per 400 square feet
Restaurants	1 space per 100 square feet
Hotels and motels	1 space per 1.25 guestrooms

# **Financial Stakeholders**

Interviews were conducted across stakeholders who <u>finance commercial and residential</u> applications to understand perspectives and implications to changes in zoning related to parking requirements (or changes to specific projects).

Stakeholders include
 Lenders, Equity Investors,
 Developers, Leasing
 Brokers, Investment Sales
 Brokers and Operators.





# Parking Utilization

Parking Occupancy Table**								
M-F	M-F	M-F	Sat & Sun	Sat & Sun	Sat & Sun			
<u>8am-5pm</u>	<u>6pm-12am</u>	<u>12am-6am</u>	<u>8am-5pm</u>	<u>6pm-12am</u>	<u>12am-6am</u>			
60%	100%	100%	80%	100%	100%			
100%	20%	5%	5%	5%	5%			
90%	80%	5%	100%	70%	5%			
70%	100%	100%	70%	100%	100%			
70%	100%	10%	70%	100%	20%			
40%	80%	10%	80%	100%	10%			
40%	100%	10%	80%	100%	50%			
100%	100%	5%	100%	100%	5%			
100%	20%	5%	10%	10%	5%			
10%	5%	5%	100%	50%	5%			
	8am-5pm 60% 100% 90% 70% 70% 40% 40% 100%	M-F         M-F           8am-5pm         6pm-12am           60%         100%           100%         20%           90%         80%           70%         100%           70%         100%           40%         80%           40%         100%           100%         100%           20%         90%	M-F         M-F         M-F           8am-5pm         6pm-12am         12am-6am           60%         100%         100%           100%         20%         5%           90%         80%         5%           90%         100%         100%           70%         100%         100%           40%         80%         10%           40%         100%         10%           100%         100%         5%           100%         5%         5%	M-F         M-F         M-F         Sat & Sun           8am-5pm         6pm-12am         12am-6am         8am-5pm           60%         100%         100%         80%           100%         20%         5%         5%           90%         80%         5%         100%           70%         100%         100%         70%           70%         100%         100%         70%           40%         80%         10%         80%           40%         100%         10%         80%           100%         100%         5%         100%           100%         20%         5%         100%	M-FM-FM-FSat & SunSat & Sun8am-5pm6pm-12am12am-6am8am-5pm6pm-12am60%100%100%80%100%100%20%5%5%5%90%80%5%100%70%90%100%100%70%100%70%100%100%70%100%70%100%10%70%100%40%80%10%80%100%40%100%10%80%100%100%20%5%100%100%100%20%5%10%10%			

\* From Victoria Transport Policy Institute "Shared Parking"

<u>Ex.</u> 100,000SF Office (2.5 space/1000SF), 10,000 SF Retail (5.0 space/1000SF). Office – 250 spaces, Retail – 50 spaces

Required Spaces are 300, however, COMBINED DEMAND may imply 285 spaces.



Complementary Utilization facilitates Parking Reduction

# **Lenders**

#### Wells Fargo

- National Commercial Lender
- Parking requirements are assessed relative to comparable product in submarket.
- Burden is on Developer to "Prove" parking sufficiency

#### State Bank

- Georgia bank focused on Atlanta Borrowers
- Financing Decatur Holiday Inn.
- Flexible to Shared Parking arrangements subject to submarket comparables

### Key: Parking relative to Comparables





#### Selig Enterprises

- Local Atlanta based investor focused on Retail including Decatur CVS
- Evaluate parking based on needs (and ability to rent to) Tenant
- Support Shared Parking potential cost reduction

#### » Brookdale Group

- Southeastern real estate private equity group
- Only invests where parking meets zoning requirements
- Invested in other markets at 1.8 spaces/1000 SF (vs. 2.5)
- Support for Shared Parking

#### **Support Shared Parking**



# **Developers/Operators**

### › Oakhurst Capital

- Acquirer and third party leasing agent of Decatur office and multi-family in Decatur
- Indicated Shared Parking Opportunities available exist in Decatur (and referenced 10 year Strategic Plan
- Decatur Renaissance Redevelopment unsuccessful due to required parking minimums



### LAZ Parking

- National Parking Operator which currently operates 6 decks in Decatur
- Indicates Surplus of parking in Decatur --- no deck 60% occupied.
- Office need only 2.0 spaces per 1,000 SF
- Need improved Cohesive Messaging/Wayfinding Program



### Tremendous opportunity for shared parking

# **Brokers/Marketing Groups**

### Cushman and Wakefield

- . National real estate investment bank
- Successfully sold Decatur Renaissance, Decatur Medical Plaza, One West Court Square
- Huge Demand for Paid Parking
- Emphasize need to flexibility to allow shared parking and reciprocal easement agreements to facilitate mixed use.

### Eastdil Secured

- National real estate investment bank
- Successfully markets shared parking or rights to offsite/ground leases.
- Dependent on competitive properties and access to public transportation

**Investors Understand Shared** 

Parking

- Actual Utilization is justifies ultimate need.
- Institutional Owners are more sensitive to variations from required zoning than Entrepeneurial Owners.



# **Potential Cost Savings**

	SF/	Cost/	Per	Soft	Total
Parking Cost	<u>Space</u>	<u>SF</u>	<u>Space</u>	<u>Costs (a)</u>	<u>Costs</u>
Open Curtainwall Skined Frame	350	47.15	\$ 16,503	\$ 13,502	\$ 30,005
Same as above, but only precast spandrels	350	43.1	\$ 15,085	\$ 12,342	\$ 27,427
Precast Deck w/ Architectural/Structured Spandrels	350	34.5	\$ 12,075	\$ 9,880	\$ 21,955
Enclosed in Office Tower	450	64	\$ 28,800	\$ 23,564	\$ 52,364
Atlanta - Screened Openings and smaller site (a) may vary due to land size	375	45	\$ 16,875	\$ 13,807	\$ 30,682
Assumed Total Construction Cost Per Space					\$ 30,000

	SF/	Required	Required	Spaces	Estimated
Cost Savings - 20% Reduction/\$30,000 per space	<u>Units</u>	<u>Parking</u>	<u>Spaces</u>	"Saved"	<u>Savings</u>
Retail	100,000	0.005	500	100 \$	\$ 3,000,000
Office	100,000	0.0025	250	50 \$	\$ 1,500,000
Multifamily	50	1	50	10 9	\$ 300,000
Hotel	100	0.80	80	16 5	\$ 480,000
					Г
				<	
		Cost/	Initial	Cost	% Savings
Project Savings	<u>SF</u>	<u>SF or unit</u>	<u>Cost</u>	<u>Savings</u>	<u>of Total Cost</u>
Retail	100,000	200 \$	\$ 20,000,000	3,000,000	15.0%
Office	100,000	250 \$	\$ 25,000,000	1,500,000	6.0%
Multifamily	50	250,000	\$ 12,500,000	300,000	2.4%
Hotel	100	\$ 200,000	\$ 20,000,000	480,000	2.4%



Urban Land Atlanta Institute Serving Georgia, Alabama, and Eastern Tennessee



- Comparable submarket product determines Investor "Comfort"
- Investors understand Shared Parking and Reciprocal Easements/Off-site Parking
- > Difficulty is **Actual Change** to submarket requirements.



## General Market Attitudes Parking Maximums Shared Parking Unbundled Parking





### **Parking Maximums**

Reduce future flexibility End user drives quantity





## **Shared Parking**

Easier to implement in theory than in practice Additional legal documents (condo docs)





### **Unbundled Parking**

Theoretical savings for affordable housing

Lack of parking at end of sales/lease-up





### **Positive Environmental Impacts**

- Decreased costs (site work)
- Minimized energy consumption (utility bills)
- Reduced need for storm water management
- Encouraged use of alternative transportation

\*Savings can offset greening costs





### **Recommended Features**

- Close to pedestrian paths/transportation stops
- Green roofs
- Permeable pavements or pavers
- High albedo paving materials
- Preferred parking for LEVs and carpools
- LED Lighting
- Rainwater Collection



## **Costs:**

Great variability

Generally 1-2% premium (LEED Certified/Silver)

Cost ranges:

Green Roof - \$15 - \$40/SF (\$75 - \$200k)

Rainwater collection - \$15 - \$30K/system

Photovoltaics - \$7,500/module

LED lighting - \$50-\$250/fixture kit

### Examples

Regent Partners – Oakland Park Project (\$15/SF)

Duke University – First LEED Certified Parking Deck

- Previously developed site
- Rainwater collection cisterns
- Rain gardens
- LED lighting
- Recycled Materials

## **Conclusions/Recommendations**

**1. No legal challenges at State level** 

## **2. Zoning Changes**

Parking Maximums: establish in conjunction with parking overlay district

Shared Parking: add to zoning code as a suggestion and not a mandate

Unbundled Parking: add to zoning code as a mechanism for affordable housing

### 3. Maximum/Shared/Unbundled promotes sustainability and smart land use

## **Conclusions/Recommendations**

- 4. Maintain flexibility for future developers/owners (ex: Parking Banks, Parking Overlay Zones, Fees in Lieu)
- 5. City of Decatur right characteristics to maximize parking across uses.

(Walkability, Public Transportation, Proximity to higher density)

- 6. Financial Stakeholders flexible/adaptive to changes in parking minimums.
- 7. Anecdotal "Tremendous Opportunity for shared parking."





