Feasibility Study for Gateway Property in Historic South Atlanta



focused COMMUNITY strategies



The Team



focused COMMUNITY strategies







Katie Delp **Executive Director**



Shawn Duncan **Director of Training** & Consulting



Jeff Delp **Director of Econ. Development**



Danielle

Clay

Cynthia McNeal Director of Mixed-Income Housing





Shirlynn **Brownell City of Brookhaven**



F.L.I. Properties



Josh Gately **Portman Holdings**

Steve

Hinkle

Will Johnston **BBVA Compass MicroLife Institute**





DNG

MRC-2 MRC-2 MRC-2 MRC-2 MRC-2 MRC-2 MRC-2 MRC-2 MRC-2

Site Location

			DEVELOPMENT	SITE				
		12 12 2-1.	PHASE I Parcel ID	Address	Size (acres)	Size (SF)	Current Zoning	
•	McDonough Blvd		14-0056-0005-053-8	71 McDonough Blvd SE	0.14	6,000	C-1-C	
This and here the	Tric Donough Divu		14-0056-0005-055	73 McDonough Blvd SE	0.07	3,200	C-1-C	
	A STREET	Jonesh	14-0056-0005-056	75 McDonough Blvd SE	0.07	3,200	C-1-C	
		1 13 - OTO	14-0056-0005-026	77 McDonough Blvd SE	0.13	5,540	C-1-C	
	PHASE I 1.17 acres	CARVER MKT / Ma	14-0056-0005-027	79 McDonough Blvd SE	0.12	5,180	C-1-C	
PHASE II	PHASE I	COMMUNITY	14-0056-0005-028	83 McDonough Blvd SE	0.20	8,649	C-1-C	
PHAJE II	5 PHASEI	E KIR SALAR	14-0056-0005-060	N/A	0.18	7,690	C-1-C	
1.19 acres	2 1.17 acres	GROUNDS	14-0056-0005-057	1280 Marcy St SE	0.08	3,400	C-1-C	
The states			14-0056-0005-058	1284 Marcy St SE	0.08	3,700	C-1-C	
			14-0056-0005-059	1288 Marcy St SE	0.10	4,400	C-1-C	
1.19 acres			SUBTOTAL (PHASE I)		1.17	50,959		
			PHASE II (POTENTIA	AL)				
1211			Parcel ID	Address		Size (SF)	Current	
The second s		A CONTRACT OF			(acres)		Zoning	
		and a state of the	14 0056 LL006	N/A	1.19	51,937	R-5	
and the second second		Marian . The art and	SUBTOTAL (PHASE II	•	1.19	51,937		
Mark Star			TOTAL (PHASE I & II)		2.36	102,896		

May 9, 2019

4

Propose Zoning MRC-2

HE SITE / ZONING

Focused Community Strategies (FCS): Mixed-Income Housing

- FCS creates home buying and rental opportunities for all residents across the income spectrum. They renovate abandoned properties, tear down dilapidated properties for new construction, and own rental homes in the community to create a balanced housing inventory.
- Since 2000, home ownership in its target neighborhood has increased from 10% to over 50%.
- Almost a quarter of homes owned in the community are owned by low income families.





after

FOR EACH DOLLAR DONATED TO FCS, THREE DOLLARS ARE INVESTED into the redevelopment of South Atlanta.

Two thirds of all revenue is earned income from home sales, rental revenue, grocery sales, cafe sales, training and consulting fees, bike sales, and book sales.

South Atlanta Neighborhood



- Located 2 miles south of Downtown Atlanta.
- Neighborhood originally developed because of Clark College and proximity to railroad lines.
- Food desert prior to FCS opening Carver Market in 2015.
- Ron Clark Academy opened in 2007 and PurposeBuilt has taken over the Carver High School Cluster.





COLUMBIA BLACKSHEAR SENIOR HOUSING



SOUTH ATLANTA



T.

Community Engagement: One at a Time

- FCS has a robust community engagement practice
- Community Leaders
- Community Meetings
- Marketing and Communication Plan
- Neighborhood buy in



Site Photos













ZONING

TIS 3H.

THE SITE / ZONING

Current and Proposed Zoning

CURRENT ZONING



PROPOSED ZONING



May 9, 2019

9

MRC-2 Zoning Requirements

MRC-2 Zoning: Base Floor Area Ratio

Non Residential	Residential	Combined
2.5	0.696	3.196

MRC-2 Zoning: Bonus Floor Area Ratio (FAR)

Residential (Open Space & Streets) ^{1, 2}	Residential (Affordable Housing) ³	Residential (Ground Floor Commercial) ⁴	Residential (Civic)	Max. FAR with Bonuses
2 sq. ft. of residential floor		1 sq. ft. of residential floor	1 sq. ft. of residential floor	
area for every 1 sq. ft. of open space	0.5	area for every 2 sq. ft. of commercial space	area for every 1 sq. ft. of civic space	3.696

NOTES:

- 1. Open Space: Open space shall meet the requirements of subsection 16-34.006(2)(g)(iv).
- 2. Streets: Streets shall meet the requirements of section 16-34.012 and subsection 16-34.010(5)(e).
- **3.** Affordable Housing: Minimum of 20 percent of the total floor area developed shall be used for affordable rental housing. The percentage mix of affordable Studio, 1 BR, 2 BR and 3 BR units shall be proportionally similar to the percentage mix in the overall development.
- 4. Ground Floor Commercial: Developments which provide street-fronting, sidewalk level retail establishments or eating and drinking establishments which comprise a minimum of 20 percent of the building footprint and meet all of the requirements of subsection 16-34.014(6)
- 5. Open Space Bonus: Residential uses shall be permitted to calculate any of the above floor areas in subsection 16-34.027(1) utilizing gross lot area, for purposes of providing additional density based on such calculation. Developments utilizing the open space bonus shall not be permitted any reduction in open space requirements.
- 6. Site Limitations: Minimum façade height of 24 feet along each façade adjacent to any sidewalk or supplemental zone. Maximum height of 52 feet for structures which are within 150 feet of any R-1 through R-5; R-G 1; R-G 2; MR-1, MR-2, or PD-H district. Maximum height of 225 feet for structures that are greater than 150 feet from any R-1 through R-5, R-G 1, R-G 2, MR-1, MR-2, or PD-H district

SITE LIMITATIONS:

- Minimum façade height of 24 feet along each façade adjacent to any sidewalk or supplemental zone.
- Maximum height of 52 feet for structures which are within 150 feet of any R-1 through R-5; R-G 1; R-G 2; MR-1, MR-2, or PD-H district.
- Maximum height of 225 feet for structures that are greater than 150 feet from any R-1 through R-5,

SOURCE: http://atlanta.elaws.us/code/coor_ptiii_pt16_ch34_sec16-34.027

MRC-2 Zoning Requirements









Building-Entries Along-Major-Streets

LACK MORE

Demographic Summary

Population	1 mile	3 mile	5 mile
2018 Population	14,555	115,020	302,446
2023 Population	15,438	122,161	320,560
Population Growth (2018-2023)	6.10%	6.20%	6.00%
2018 Average Age	35	35	36
Households (HH)			
2018 HH	5,068	43,529	123,933
2023 HH	5,364	46,175	131,225
HH Growth (2018-2023)	5.80%	6.10%	5.90%
Median HH Income	\$21,853	\$35,317	\$44,789
Average HH Size	2.5	2.2	2.1
Average HH Vehicles	1	1	1
Housing			
Median Home Value	\$88,160	\$164,376	\$191,801
Median Year Built	1966	1964	1965

2018 Population by Age



Percentage of People 1 Mile Radius 5 Mile Radius

Household Size (2018)



Housing Units (2018)





Educational Attainment (2018)



5 Mile Radius

Employment (2018)



Household Income (2018)



Population by Occupation (2018)



BUSINESSES & EMPLOYMENT (1 MILE RADIUS)

			-
Business Employment by Type	# Bus	# Emp	# Emp / Bus
Retail & Wholesale Trade	44	650	15
Educational Services	16	534	33
Public Administration & Sales	11	410	37
Other Services	56	269	5
Manufacturing	10	215	22
Health Care & Social Assistance	47	203	4
Hospitality & Food Service	16	176	11
Real Estate, Renting, Leasing	24	108	5
Scientific & Technology Services	18	80	4
Utilities & Waste Management	9	62	7
Information	5	44	9
Finance & Insurance	10	43	4
Construction	6	41	7
Arts, Entertainment, Recreation	1	1	1
Total Businesses	273	2,836	10

Consumer Expenditures

2018 Annual Spending (\$000's)	1 Mi		3 Mi		5 Mile		
2018 Annual Spending (5000 S)	TIMIE		5 1011	le	2 141116		
Apparel	\$6,775	8.4%	\$57,580	7.2%	\$165,424	6.6%	
Ent. & Hobbies	\$6,504	8.1%	\$65 <i>,</i> 570	8.2%	\$204,623	8.1%	
Food & Alcohol	\$23,961	29.7%	\$226,077	28.2%	\$693,844	27.6%	
Household (Maint, Etc)	\$10,222	12.7%	\$113,121	14.1%	\$373,839	14.9%	
Transport. / Maint.	\$18,560	23.0%	\$187,101	23.4%	\$586,989	23.3%	
Health Care	\$3,246	4.0%	\$34 <i>,</i> 540	4.3%	\$112,234	4.5%	
Education / Day Care	\$4,283	5.3%	\$49,789	6.2%	\$172,482	6.9%	
Total Consumer Spending	\$80,565	100.0%	\$800,641	100.0%	\$2,516,891	100.0%	





Multifamily Rent Comps (Properties with Affordable Units)



ASHLEY WEST END (2001)







COLUMBIA AT MECHANICSVILLE CROSSING (2009)







May 9, 2019

. N

R

Multifamily Rent Comps (Properties with Affordable Units)









REN.

Multifamily Rent Comps (Properties with Affordable Units)

MARKET / AFFORDABLE RENT COMPS

				Total				1 BR		2 BR			3 BR					
			Comp	Avg Asking	Avg SF /	Avg Asking		Avg Asking	Avg SF /	Avg Asking		Avg Asking	Avg SF	Avg Asking		Avg Asking	Avg SF /	Avg Asking
Property	Yr Built	Vacancy	Units	Rent/Unit	Unit	Rent/SF	Units	Rent/Unit	Unit	Rent/SF	Units	Rent/Unit	/ Unit	Rent/SF	Units	Rent/Unit	Unit	Rent/SF
SOUTH ATLANTA GATEWAY (Phase I)	TBD	N/A	26	\$739	909	\$0.81	8	\$661	650	\$1.02	14	\$756	960	\$0.79	4	\$835	1,250	\$0.67
Heritage Station	2007	2.7%	220	\$1,086	1,044	\$1.04	45	\$900	846	\$1.06	138	\$1,102	1,058	\$1.04	37	\$1,255	1,232	\$1.02
Villages at Carver	2001	4.1%	655	\$1,320	985	\$1.34	137	\$1,055	742	\$1.42	339	\$1,422	970	\$1.47	179	\$1,328	1,201	\$1.11
Columbia Peoplestown	2003	5.0%	100	\$1,303	1,157	\$1.13					73	\$1,285	1,103	\$1.17	27	\$1,350	1,302	\$1.04
Ashley West End	2001	3.6%	112	\$1,075	830	\$1.29	44	\$1,003	689	\$1.46	68	\$1,121	921	\$1.22				
Capitol Gateway	2005	6.2%	421	\$1,621	942	\$1.72	160	\$1,312	771	\$1.70	232	\$1,778	1,017	\$1.75	29	\$2,065	1,291	\$1.60
Columbia at Mechanicsville Crossing	2009	3.7%	164	\$1,143	1,005	\$1.14	30	\$976	750	\$1.30	100	\$1,123	1,014	\$1.11	34	\$1,351	1,204	\$1.12
Columbia at Sylvan Hills	2007	4.7%	191	\$881	987	\$0.89	58	\$880	768	\$1.15	126	\$861	1,067	\$0.81	7	\$1,253	1,356	\$0.92
Columbia Commons	2002	5.1%	158	\$936	1,270	\$0.74					122	\$912	1,222	\$0.75	36	\$1,019	1,432	\$0.71
Columbia at Mechanicsville Station	2009	10.9%	174	\$1,178	1,040	\$1.13	23	\$975	750	\$1.30	93	\$1,120	1,011	\$1.11	58	\$1,350	1,200	\$1.13
Columbia Parkside at Mechanicsville	2011	1.3%	156	\$1,033	1,065	\$0.97	56	\$968	729	\$1.33	77	\$1,022	1,231	\$0.83	23	\$1,230	1,329	\$0.93
PROPERTIES IN LEASE-UP (Excl. from Va	icancy)																	
Platform Apartments	2018	62.7%	324	\$1,724	986	\$1.75	145	\$1,460	794	\$1.84	171	\$1,966	1,168	\$1.68				
TOTAL (EXCL SUBJECT)		4.8%	2,675	\$1,295	1,010	\$1.28	698	\$1,157	765	\$1.51	1,539	\$1,344	1,057	\$1.27	430	\$1,345	1,245	\$1.08

Multifamily Rent Comps (Only Market Units)



Multifamily Rent Comps (Only Market Units)



Multifamily Rent Comps (Only Market Units)

MARKET ONLY RENT COMPS

Total			1 BR		2 BR			3 BR										
			Comp	Avg Asking	Avg SF /	Avg Asking		Avg Asking	Avg SF /	Avg Asking		Avg Asking	Avg SF	Avg Asking		Avg Asking	Avg SF /	Avg Asking
Property	Yr Built	Vacancy	Units	Rent/Unit	Unit	Rent/SF	Units	Rent/Unit	Unit	Rent/SF	Units	Rent/Unit	/ Unit	Rent/SF	Units	Rent/Unit	Unit	Rent/SF
SOUTH ATLANTA GATEWAY (Phase I)	TBD	N/A	26	\$739	909	\$0.81	8	\$661	650	\$1.02	14	\$756	960	\$0.79	4	\$835	1,250	\$0.67
841 Memorial Dr	2016	7.5%	80	\$1,567	817	\$1.92	48	\$1,461	763	\$1.91	15	\$1,991	1,148	\$1.73				
Alexan EAV	2016	3.3%	120	\$1,548	897	\$1.73	84	\$1,414	787	\$1.80	35	\$1,876	1,169	\$1.60				
Brookside Park	2005	5.0%	201	\$1,454	1,085	\$1.34	56	\$1,261	830	\$1.52	102	\$1,504	1,119	\$1.34	43	\$1,588	1,335	\$1.19
Glenwood at Grant Park	2016	22.2%	216	\$1,496	824	\$1.82	121	\$1,386	732	\$1.89	65	\$1,820	1,085	\$1.68				
Glenwood Park Lofts	2008	6.0%	235	\$1,427	979	\$1.46	155	\$1,344	858	\$1.57	80	\$1,588	1,214	\$1.31				
The George	2017	5.3%	132	\$1,509	661	\$2.28	97	\$1,422	591	\$2.41	35	\$1,749	855	\$2.05				
The Leonard	2015	7.1%	85	\$1,388	663	\$2.09	67	\$1,310	595	\$2.20	18	\$1,678	914	\$1.84				
PROPERTIES IN LEASE-UP (Excl. from \	/acancy)																	
Lumen Grant Park	2018	69.7%	238	\$2,096	975	\$2.15	92	\$1,619	724	\$2.24	103	\$2,265	1,063	\$2.13	39	\$2,850	1,372	\$2.08
TOTAL (EXCL SUBJECT)		8.9%	1,307	\$1,590	899	\$1.77	720	\$1,403	742	\$1.89	453	\$1,808	1,094	\$1.65	82	\$2,188	1,353	\$1.62

Retail Rent Comps









\$22.00 psf







REN.

Retail Rent Comps









2,800 sq ft / 0% Vacancy

9,000 sq ft / 30.3% Vacancy



REN.

Office Rent Comps



DEV / OP COST

The Project Concept – Phased Approach

PHASE 1 (NEXT TO CARVER MARKET)

3RD FLOOR					
Space Use / Floorplan	Size	Multifamily Units/Floor	%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
1 BR	650	4	19.2%	2,600	4
2 BR	960	7	49.7%	6,720	9
3 BR	1,250	2	18.5%	2,500	3
Corridors / Misc Space	1,710	N/A	12.6%	1,710	N/A

2ND FLOOR

TOTAL

Space Use / Floorplan	Size Units/Floo		%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
1 BR	650	4	19.2%	2,600	4
2 BR	960	7	49.7%	6,720	9
3 BR	1,250	2	18.5%	2,500	3
Corridors / Misc Space	1,710	N/A	12.6%	1,710	N/A
TOTAL		13	100.0%	13,530	16

13

100.0%

13,530

16

GROUND FLOOR

Space Use / Floorplan	Size	Multifamily Units/Floor	%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
Retail Space 1	3,000	N/A	22.2%	3,000	10
Retail Space 2	1,500	N/A	11.1%	1,500	5
Retail Space 3	1,500	N/A	11.1%	1,500	5
Retail Space 4	1,500	N/A	11.1%	1,500	5
Lobby / Misc Space	6,030	N/A	44.6%	6,030	N/A
TOTAL	13,530		100.0%	13,530	25

GRAND TOTAL

Space Use / Floorplan Ave Size	Units	%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
Multifamily	26	58.2%	23,640	32
Retail	4	18.5%	7,500	25
Lobby / Corridor / Misc Space	N/A	23.3%	9,450	N/A
TOTAL		100.0%	40,590	57

May 9, 2019

PHASE 2 (NEXT TO THE NEW SCHOOLS AT CARVER)

3RD FLOOR					
Space Use / Floorplan	Size	Multifamily Units/Floor	%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
1 BR	650	4	19.2%	2,600	4
2 BR	960	7	49.7%	6,720	9
3 BR	1,250	2	18.5%	2,500	3
Corridors / Misc Space	1,710	N/A	12.6%	1,710	N/A
TOTAL		13	100.0%	13,530	16

2ND FLOOR

Space Use / Floorplan	Size	Multifamily Units/Floor	%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
1 BR	650	4	19.2%	2,600	4
2 BR	960	7	49.7%	6,720	9
3 BR	1,250	2	18.5%	2,500	3
Corridors / Misc Space	1,710	N/A	12.6%	1,710	N/A
TOTAL		13	100.0%	13,530	16

GROUND FLOOR

Space Use / Floorplan	Size	Multifamily Units/Floor	%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
1 BR	650	3	14.4%	1,950	3
2 BR	960	6	42.6%	5,760	8
3 BR	1,250	0	0.0%	0	0
Lobby / Misc Space	5,820	N/A	43.0%	5,820	N/A
TOTAL	8,680		100.0%	13,530	11

GRAND TOTAL				
Space Use / Floorplan Ave Size	Units	%	Total SF	Parking Spaces
Multifamily	26	77.2%	31,350	43
Retail	0	0.0%	0	0
Lobby / Corridor / Misc Space	N/A	22.8%	9,240	N/A
TOTAL		100.0%	40,590	43







28

Development Cost (Multifamily)

DEVELOPMENT BUDGET (MULTIFAMILY)	ļ	Amount	\$	/ Unit	\$ / SF	%
Land						
Land Cost	\$	100,000	\$	3,846	\$ 3.02	2.1%
Total Land	\$	100,000	\$	3,846	\$ 3.02	2.1%
Hard Cost						
Hard Cost	\$ 3	2,795,000	\$:	107,500	\$ 84.47	59.3%
Parking & Site Work	\$	110,500	\$	4,250	\$ 3.34	2.3%
Contractor OH & Profit	\$	161,200	\$	6,200	\$ 4.87	3.4%
Hard Cost Contingency	\$	161,200	\$	6,200	\$ 4.87	3.4%
Total Hard Cost	\$3	3,227,900	\$:	124,150	\$ 97.55	68.5%
Soft Cost						
Architecture & Engineering	\$	125,000	\$	4,808	\$ 3.78	2.7%
Legal, Organizational & Closing	\$	36,100	\$	1,388	\$ 1.09	0.8%
Permits, Inspections & Fees	\$	54,600	\$	2,100	\$ 1.65	1.2%
Third Party Reports and Studies	\$	22,246	\$	856	\$ 0.67	0.5%
Furniture, Fixtures & Equipment	\$	28,600	\$	1,100	\$ 0.86	0.6%
Marketing and Leasing	\$	9,100	\$	350	\$ 0.28	0.2%
Constr. Period Taxes & Insurance	\$	32,571	\$	1,253	\$ 0.98	0.7%
Financing Fees	\$	10,000	\$	385	\$ 0.30	0.2%
Developer Fee	\$	706,500	\$	27,173	\$ 21.35	15.0%
Soft Cost Contingency	\$	32,000	\$	1,231	\$ 0.97	0.7%
Total Soft Cost	\$:	1,056,717	\$	40,643	\$ 31.93	22.4%
SUBTOTAL	\$ 4	4,384,617	\$:	168,639	\$ 132.51	93.0%
Carry & Project Costs						
Interest Reserve	\$	50,000	\$	1,923	\$ 1.51	1.1%
Op Deficit Reserve (Multifamily)	\$	140,400	\$	5,400	\$ 4.24	3.0%
Owner's Contingency	\$	140,000	\$	5,385	\$ 4.23	3.0%
Total Carry & Project Costs	\$	330,400	\$	12,708	\$ 9.98	7.0%
TOTAL DEVELOPMENT COST	\$ 4	4,715,017	\$:	181,347	\$ 142.49	100.0%



Source: GAO analysis of data from state and local housing finance agencies. | GAO-18-637

DEV / OP COST

Development Cost (Multifamily)



May 9, 2019

Development Cost (Retail)

DEVELOPMENT BUDGET (RETAIL)	ŀ	Amount	\$ / SF	%
Hard Cost				
Hard Cost (Retail)	\$	562,500	\$ 75.00	54.0%
Hard Cost Contingency (Retail)	\$	16,875	\$ 2.25	1.6%
Retail TI	\$	262,500	\$ 35.00	25.2%
Total Hard Cost	\$	841,875	\$ 112.25	80.8%
Soft Cost				
Retail LC	\$	45,000	\$ 6.00	4.3%
Soft Cost (Retail)	\$	100,000	\$ 13.33	9.6%
Soft Cost Contingency (Retail)	\$	20,000	\$ 2.67	1.9%
Total Soft Cost	\$	165,000	\$ 22.00	15.8%
SUBTOTAL	\$:	1,006,875	\$ 134.25	96.6%
Carry Costs				
Op Deficit Reserve (Retail)	\$	35,000	\$ 4.67	3.4%
Total Carry Costs	\$	35,000	\$ 4.67	3.4%
TOTAL DEVELOPMENT COST	\$:	1,041,875	\$ 138.92	100.0%



Development Cost (Consolidated)

DEVELOPMENT BUDGET (CONSOLIDATED)	ŀ	Amount	\$ / SF	%
Land				
Land Cost	\$	100,000	\$ 2.46	2.1%
Total Land	\$	100,000	\$ 2.46	2.1%
Hard Cost				
Hard Cost	\$2	2,795,000	\$ 68.86	59.3%
Parking & Site Work	\$	110,500	\$ 2.72	2.3%
Contractor OH & Profit	\$	161,200	\$ 3.97	3.4%
Hard Cost Contingency	\$	161,200	\$ 3.97	3.4%
Hard Cost (Retail)	\$	562,500	\$ 13.86	11.9%
Hard Cost Contingency (Retail)	\$	16,875	\$ 0.42	0.4%
Retail TI	\$	262,500	\$ 6.47	5.6%
Total Hard Cost	\$4	4,069,775	\$ 100.27	86.3%
Soft Cost				
Architecture & Engineering	\$	125,000	\$ 3.08	2.7%
Legal, Organizational & Closing	\$	36,100	\$ 0.89	0.8%
Permits, Inspections & Fees	\$	54,600	\$ 1.35	1.2%
Third Party Reports and Studies	\$	22,246	\$ 0.55	0.5%
Furniture, Fixtures & Equipment	\$	28,600	\$ 0.70	0.6%
Marketing and Leasing	\$	9,100	\$ 0.22	0.2%
Constr. Period Taxes & Insurance	\$	32,571	\$ 0.80	0.7%
Financing Fees	\$	10,000	\$ 0.25	0.2%
Developer Fee	\$	706,500	\$ 17.41	15.0%
Soft Cost Contingency	\$	32,000	\$ 0.79	0.7%
Retail LC	\$	45,000	\$ 1.11	1.0%
Soft Cost (Retail)	\$	100,000	\$ 2.46	2.1%
Soft Cost Contingency (Retail)	\$	20,000	\$ 0.49	0.4%
Total Soft Cost	\$:	1,221,717	\$ 30.10	25.9%
SUBTOTAL	\$!	5,391,492	\$ 132.83	114.3%
Carry & Project Costs				
Interest Reserve	\$	50,000	\$ 1.23	1.1%
Op Deficit Reserve (Multifamily)	\$	140,400	\$ 3.46	3.0%
Op Deficit Reserve (Retail)	\$	35,000	\$ 0.86	0.7%
Owner's Contingency	\$	140,000	\$ 3.45	3.0%
Total Carry & Project Costs	\$	365,400	\$ 9.00	7.7%
TOTAL DEVELOPMENT COST	\$!	5,756,892	\$ 141.83	122.1%



May 9, 2019

Real Estate Taxes (Land and Improvements)

LAND (PHASE I)			Asse	ssor's Mark	et Value	
Parcel	Size (acres)	2016	2017	2018	Projected 2019	Stabilized (Inc. Below)
14-0056-0005-053-8	0.14	\$65,700	\$65,700	\$65,700	\$65,700	N/A
14-0056-0005-055-3	0.07	\$58,100	\$58,100	\$58,100	\$58,100	N/A
14-0056-0005-056-1	0.07	\$58,100	\$58,100	\$58,100	\$58,100	N/A
14-0056-0005-026-4	0.13	\$34,900	\$34,900	\$34,900	\$34,900	N/A
14-0056-0005-027-2	0.12	\$24,500	\$24,500	\$108,900	\$158,000	N/A
14-0056-0005-028-0	0.20	\$70,700	\$70,700	\$70,700	\$70,700	N/A
14-0056-0005-060-3	0.18	\$35,100	\$35,100	\$35,100	\$35,100	N/A
14-0056-0005-057-9	0.08	\$19,600	\$19,600	\$19,600	\$19,600	N/A
14-0056-0005-058-7	0.08	\$20,200	\$20,200	\$20,200	\$20,200	N/A
14-0056-0005-059-5	0.10	\$9,000	\$9,000	\$9,400	\$43,000	N/A
Subtotal (Land Value)	1.17	\$395,900	\$395,900	\$480,700	\$563,400	N/A
Assessed Value at 40% of Market		\$158,360	\$158,360	\$192,280	\$225,360	N/A
Real Estate Taxes (\$)		\$6,854	\$6,840	\$7,960	\$9,416	N/A
Real Estate Taxes (\$ per acre)		\$5,859	\$5,846	\$6,805	\$8,048	N/A

MULTIFAMILY (PHASE I)			Asse	ssor's Mark	et Value	
					Projected	
Project Component	Size (Units)	2016	2017	2018	2019	Stabilized
Proposed Improvements (Multifamily)	26	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1,560,000
Assessed Value at 40% of Market						\$624,000
Real Estate Taxes (\$)						\$26,071
Real Estate Taxes (\$ per Unit)						\$1,003
			Asse	ssor's Mark	et Value	\$1,003
Real Estate Taxes (\$ per Unit)			Asse	ssor's Marl	et Value Projected	
RETAIL (PHASE I)	Size (SF)	2016	Asse 2017	ssor's Mark 2018		
,	Size (SF) 7,500	2016 N/A			Projected	
RETAIL (PHASE I) Project Component			2017	2018	Projected 2019	Stabilized
RETAIL (PHASE I) Project Component Proposed Improvements (Retail)			2017	2018	Projected 2019	Stabilized \$1,125,000

Operating Expense (Multifamily)

SOUTH ATL GATEWAY	۲ (MI	JLTIFA	MILY P	ROFOR	MA)
		Year 1	\$/Unit	\$/Unit/Mo	% GPR
INCOME					
Gross Potential Rent (Multifamily)	\$	230,616	\$8,870	\$739.15	100.0%
Total Potential Gross Income	\$	230,616	\$8,870	\$739.15	100.0%
Vacancy (Multifamily)	\$	(11,761)	\$ (452)	\$ (37.70)	-5.1%
Concessions	\$	-	\$-	\$-	0.0%
Credit & Collection Loss	\$	(1,176)	(\$45)	(\$3.77)	-0.5%
Effective Rental Income	\$	217,678	\$8,372	\$697.69	94.4%
OTHER INCOME					
Other Income (Multifamily)	\$	4,612	\$177	\$14.78	2.0%
Total Other Income	\$	4,612	\$177	\$14.78	2.0%
Effective Gross Revenue	\$	222,291	\$8,550	\$712.47	96.4%
OPERATING EXPENSES					
Real Estate Taxes	\$	26,071	\$1,003	\$83.56	11.3%
Property Insurance	\$	6,370	\$245	\$20.42	2.8%
Utilities	\$	16,900	\$650	\$54.17	7.3%
General & Administrative	\$	7,800	\$300	\$25.00	3.4%
Repairs & Maintenance	\$	14,950	\$575	\$47.92	6.5%
Contract Services	\$	10,400	\$400	\$33.33	4.5%
Payroll	\$	33,800	\$1,300	\$108.33	14.7%
Marketing & Leasing	\$	2,470	\$95	\$7.92	1.1%
Turnover / Make Ready	\$	2,600	\$100	\$8.33	1.1%
Management Fee	\$	11,531	\$443	\$36.96	5.0%
Total Operating Expenses	\$	132,892	\$5,111	\$425.94	57.6%
NOI (Before Reserves)	\$	89,399	\$3,438	\$286.54	38.8%
Reserves	\$	6,500	\$250	\$20.83	2.8%
NOI (After Reserves)	\$	82,899	\$3,188	\$265.70	35.9%
Economic Vacancy (Multifamily))			5.5%	6	
Loan Amount			\$1,037,	304	
DSCR (5.75%, 35 yr am)			1.20	x	



SOURCE: Cohn Reznick Report, 2018

OP EX BENCHMARKS (PER UNIT)	SUBJECT	SUBSIDIZED PROP.
	SOUTH ATL	GARDEN
EXPENSE CATEGORY	GATEWAY	PROPERTIES
Utilities	\$650	\$779
General & Administrative	\$300	\$402
Repairs & Maintenance	\$575	\$573
Contract Services	\$400	\$430
Payroll	\$1,300	\$1,385
Marketing & Leasing	\$95	\$92
Turnover / Make Ready	\$100	\$0
TOTAL (EXCL. MGT FEE & CONTROLLABLE)	\$3,420	\$3,661
Management Fee	\$443	\$522
Real Estate Taxes	\$1,003	\$768
Property Insurance	\$245	\$291
Replacement Reserves	\$250	\$250
TOTAL (MGT FEE & CONTROLLABLE)	\$1,941	\$1,831
GRAND TOTAL	\$5,361	\$5,492

OP EX BENCHMARKS (PER SF)	SUBJECT	SUBSIDIZED PROP.
EXPENSE CATEGORY	SOUTH ATL GATEWAY	GARDEN PROPERTIES
Utilities	\$0.51	\$0.83
General & Administrative	\$0.24	\$0.43
Repairs & Maintenance	\$0.45	\$0.61
Contract Services	\$0.31	\$0.46
Payroll	\$1.02	\$1.48
Marketing & Leasing	\$0.07	\$0.10
Turnover / Make Ready	\$0.08	\$0.00
TOTAL (EXCL. MGT FEE & CONTROLLABLE)	\$2.69	\$2.88
Management Fee	\$0.35	\$0.56
Real Estate Taxes	\$0.79	\$0.84
Property Insurance	\$0.19	\$0.31
Replacement Reserves	\$0.20	\$0.31
TOTAL (MGT FEE & CONTROLLABLE)	\$1.53	\$2.02
GRAND TOTAL	\$4.21	\$4.90

May 9, 2019

Operating Expense (Retail)

SOUTH ATL GATEWAY (RETAIL PROFORMA)

	Year 1	\$/SF	% GPR	
INCOME				
Gross Potential Rent (Retail)	\$ 150,000	\$20.00	100.0%	
Total Potential Gross Income	\$ 150,000	\$20.00	100.0%	
Vacancy (Retail)	\$ (44,250)	(\$5.90)	-29.5%	
Credit & Collection Loss (Retail)	\$ (1,770)	(\$0.24)	-1.2%	
Effective Rental Income	\$ 103,980	\$13.86	69.3%	
OTHER INCOME				
CAM Reimbursements (Retail)	\$ 27,000	\$3.60	18.0%	
Total Other Income	\$ 27,000	\$3.60	18.0%	
Potential Gross Revenue	\$ 130,980	\$17.46	87.3%	
General Vacancy	\$ -	\$0.00	0.0%	
Effective Gross Revenue	\$ 130,980	\$17.46	87.3%	
OPERATING EXPENSES				
Retail Reimb. Expenses	\$ 30,000	\$4.00	20.0%	
Retail Non-Reimb. Expenses	\$ 2,250	\$0.30	1.5%	
Total Operating Expenses	\$ 32,250	\$4.30	21.5%	
NOI (Before Reserves)	\$ 98,730	\$13.16	65.8%	
Reserves	\$ 1,875	\$0.25	1.3%	
NOI (After Reserves)	\$ 96,855	\$12.91	64.6%	
Economic Vacancy (Retail)	26.0%			

Possible Ground Floor Tenants

- Barber Shop
- Day Care
- Cleaner
- Restaurant
- Medical / Dental Office

RETAIL RENT ROLL (PHASE I)

Tenant	Suite	Size	%	Rent (\$ PSF)	Annual Rent (\$)
Retail Space 1	100	3,000	40%	\$20.00	\$60,000
Retail Space 2	110	1,500	20%	\$20.00	\$30,000
Retail Space 3	120	1,500	20%	\$20.00	\$30,000
Retail Space 4	130	1,500	20%	\$20.00	\$30,000
TOTAL		7,500	100%	\$20.00	\$150,000

 \frown

 \bigcirc

 $\overline{\Box}$

Low Income Housing Tax Credit (LIHTC) Program



Georgia® Department of M M-Community Affairs



LIHTC Tax Credit Type	9% Tax Credit	4% Tax Credit	
Competive / Non-Competitive	Competitive	Non- Competitive	
Subsidy (% of low-income unit costs)	70%	30%	
Able to Combine with Additional Federal Subsidies	No	Yes	
Est. Fed Credit Amount Avail. (Georgia)	\$25 million	No Cap	
Max. Georgia DCA Award	\$1 million	No Сар	
Georgia Department of Community Affairs (DCA) LIHTC Requirements

- <u>Maximum Gross Rents</u> based upon a percentage of Area Median Income (AMI) established by HUD.
 - Assumes 30% of income is dedicated to housing expenses (rent + utilities)
 - Assumes 1.5 persons per bedroom.
 - Gross rents may not exceed 30% of 60% of the effective AMI table for the appropriate bedroom size, unless Income Averaging is used.
- <u>Net Rents</u> are the rental portion of housing expense, after deducting the Atlanta Housing Authority (AHA) Utility Allowance.
- Income Limitations
 - **Other Income** limited to 2% of Gross Potential Rents (GPR).
 - Excludes income from commercial space.
- Operating Expense underwriting must exceed \$5,000 per unit.

- Debt Service Coverage Ratio (DSCR), excluding Deferred Developer Fees, must exceed 1.20x.
- Minimum replacement reserve of \$250 per unit.
- Minimum Set Aside
 - No less than 20% of units must be set aside for tenants whose incomes are 50% AMI or less; OR
 - No less than 40% of units must be set aside for tenants whose incomes are 60% AMI or less; **OR**
 - Average 60% AMI Income Level using Income Averaging.

Income Limits and Utility Allowances



■ 30% AMI ■ 40% AMI ■ 50% AMI ■ 60% AMI ■ 80% AMI





Max Allowable Multifamily Rent

MAX GROSS RENTS									
<u>Studio <u>1 BR</u> <u>2 BR</u> <u>3 BR</u></u>									
LIHTC	80% AMI	\$1,048	\$1,123	\$1,348	\$1,556				
LIHTC	60% AMI	\$786	\$842	\$1,011	\$1,167				
LIHTC	50% AMI	\$655	\$701	\$842	\$972				
LIHTC	40% AMI	\$524	\$561	\$674	\$778				
LIHTC	30% AMI	\$393	\$421	\$505	\$583				

NET RENTS										
<u>Studio <u>1 BR</u> <u>2 BR</u> <u>3 BR</u></u>										
LIHTC	80% AMI	\$869	\$1,123	\$1,348	\$1,556					
LIHTC	60% AMI	\$607	\$842	\$1,011	\$1,167					
LIHTC	50% AMI	\$476	\$701	\$842	\$972					
LIHTC	40% AMI	\$345	\$561	\$674	\$778					
LIHTC	30% AMI	\$214	\$421	\$505	\$583					

Unit Mix (Income Averaging)

			R	NT SCHEDU	JLE				
Unit Type	Baths	Set-Aside	#	SF	Max Gross Rent (\$/Unit)	Gross Rent (\$/Unit)	Utility Allow. (Per Unit)	Net Rent (\$/Unit)	Annual Rent (\$)
1 BEDROOM									
1 BR	1 BA	40%	3	650	\$561	\$560	\$179	\$381	\$13,716
1 BR	1 BA	60%	2	650	\$842	\$840	\$179	\$661	\$15,864
1 BR	1 BA	80%	3	650	\$1,123	\$1,120	\$179	\$941	\$33,876
1 BR SUBTOTAL			8	650	\$842	\$840	\$179	\$661	\$63,456
2 BEDROOM									
2 BR	2 BA	40%	5	960	\$674	\$670	\$250	\$420	\$25,200
2 BR	2 BA	60%	4	960	\$1,011	\$1,010	\$250	\$760	\$36,480
2 BR	2 BA	80%	5	960	\$1,348	\$1,340	\$250	\$1,090	\$65,400
2 BR SUBTOTAL			14	960	\$1,011	\$1,006	\$250	\$756	\$127,080
3 BEDROOM									
3 BR	2 BA	40%	1	1,250	\$778	\$770	\$325	\$445	\$5,340
3 BR	2 BA	60%	2	1,250	\$1,167	\$1,160	\$325	\$835	\$20,040
3 BR	2 BA	80%	1	1,250	\$1,556	\$1,550	\$325	\$1,225	\$14,700
3 BR SUBTOTAL			4	1,250	\$1,167	\$1,160	\$325	\$835	\$40,080
TOTAL / WEIGHTED	TOTAL / WEIGHTED AVERAGE				\$983	\$979	\$240	\$739	\$230,616



LIHTC Syndication

EQUITY FROM SYNDICATION OF LIHTC (QUALIFIED BASIS)

Total Development Costs			\$4,715,017
Ineligible Costs:	Legal: Permanent		(\$4,000
	Legal: LIHTC Syndication		(\$2,000
	Accounting/ Syndication Audit		(\$15,000
	Marketing		(\$9,100
	Real Estate Tax During Construction		(\$26,071
	Permanent Loan Fee		(\$25,000
	Title & Recording		(\$22,100
	Operating Deficit		(\$140,400
	Relocation Costs		\$0
	Land Acquisition		(\$100,000
	Retail Development		\$0
	Sub-Total Ineligible Costs:	=	(\$343,671
Eligible Basis:			\$4,371,346
	Percentage of Units Low-Income	Х	100.00%
	Sub-Total Qualified Basis:	=	\$4,371,346
	Qualified Census Tract	Х	130.00%
Qualified Basis:		=	\$5,682,750
	Tax Credit Rate	Х	9.00%
Estimated Annual Tax Cre	edit	=	\$511,447
Estimated Annual Allocat	ion Limit (Georgia DCA caps at \$1 million):		\$1,000,000
Annual Tax Credit Allocat	ion (Min of Ann Tax Credit Alloc. and Est. Allo	c. Limit)	\$511,447
	Tax Credit Period (years)	Х	10
	Aggregate Amount of Tax Credits	=	\$5,114,475
Price per Credit (Federal)			\$0.93
Price per Credit (State)		+	\$0.56
TOTAL Price per Credit		=	\$1.49
	Gross Syndication Proceeds	=	\$7,620,567
	LP Investor Share	Х	99.99%
MAX TAX CREDIT EQ	UITY TO PROJECT:	=	\$7,619,805
	opment Cost	=	\$3,300,512

Low-Income Housing Tax Credit Equity Pricing per Credit January 2016-March 2019



LIHTC FUNDING

HOME Investment Partnerships Program





- HUD annually allocates HOME funds to state and large local governments.
- Georgia's 2019 allocation will be set July 1, 2019.
- All units receiving HOME assistance must be occupied by households earning no more than 80% AMI
- 20% of HOME units must be affordable to households earning no more than 50% AMI, and 20% at 60% of AMI
- Approx. funding amount is \$416,000 for each phase (26 units x 40% affordable.
- Must remain affordable for 20 years+

APITAL STACK

FHLB Affordable Housing Program (AHP)



- Federal Home Loan Bank (FHLB) annually sets aside 10% of net income to fund AHP.
- Provides gap financing to develop or rehab affordable housing.
- Largest private source of affordable housing grant funds.
- Maximum of \$500,000 per project.
- Approx. funding amount for a project similar to South Atlanta Gateway is \$500,000

CAPITAL STACK

BeltLine Affordable Housing Trust Fund (BAHTF) Atlanta BeltLine

- BAHTF is funded from 15% of net revenue generated by BeltLine TAD bonds.
- Available to multifamily and single family developers.
- Only available to developments not economically feasible without this subsidy
- So far, the Fund has committed funding for
 - 75 owner-occupied / 40 affordable rental units
 - Lofts at Reynoldstown Crossing (Developed by Atlanta BeltLine, Inc.)
 - Reynoldstown Senior Housing
- Project must serve a population at or below 60% AMI for 20% of units, minimum 20% market rate units.
- Grant capped at \$2 million or 30% of development cost.
- Approx. funding amount for a project similar to South Atlanta Gateway is \$680,000
- Must remain affordable for 20 years+

Sources & Uses and Debt Terms

SOURCES & USES (MULTIFAMILY & RETAIL)										
Sources:	Amount (\$)	\$/SF	%	Uses	Amount (\$)	\$/SF	%			
Debt Financing	\$ 1,037,304	\$25.56	18.0%	Land	\$ 100,000	\$2.46	1.7%			
FHLB (AHP) / BeltLine AHTF	\$ 377,201	\$9.29	6.6%	Hard Cost	\$ 4,069,775	\$100.27	70.7%			
LIHTC Equity	\$ 3,300,512	\$81.31	57.3%	Soft Cost	\$ 1,221,717	\$30.10	21.2%			
Required Equity (Retail)	\$ 1,041,875	\$25.67	18.1%	Carry & Project Costs	\$ 365,400	\$9.00	6.3%			
Total Sources	\$ 5,756,892	\$141.83	100.0%	Total Uses	\$ 5,756,892	\$141.83	100.0%			

Loan terms									
	Loan	LTC	I/O Period	Rate	Term	Amort.			
\$	1,037,304	22.0%	12 months	5.75%	17	35			

NOTE: Debt Financing is 22% of Multifamily Development Cost (18% of Total Development Cost).

Project / Financing Recommendations

- Team up with an experienced affordable housing developer.
- Acquire more land to be able to develop more units.
 - Economies of scale.
 - Larger unit count would be more competitive size for 9% tax credit.
- Consider structured parking to add more units for each phase (cost tradeoff).
- Change project to target work force housing (80% to 120% AMI) for all units and utilize non-tax credit funding sources.



Design Concepts



Site Layout



Thanks / Questions?

LINK TO VIDEO