Bull’s Head
Rochester, New York
About the Urban Land Institute

**ULI Mission:** Shape the future of the built environment for transformative impact in communities worldwide

- A multi-disciplinary membership organization with more than 45,000 members in private enterprise and public service

- What the Urban Land Institute does:
  - Conducts Research
  - Provides a forum for sharing of best practices
  - Writes, edits, and publishes books and magazines
  - Organizes and conducts meetings
  - Directs outreach programs
  - Conducts Advisory Service Panels
ADVISORY SERVICE PANELS

Since 1947, ULI’s Advisory Services Program have helped more than 700 communities find independent, strategic, and practical solutions for the most challenging land use issues.
ULI Economic Opportunity Panel

- Series of economic opportunity panels concentrating on African American communities and communities of color
- The goal is to attract real estate investment to achieve more equitable development, economic, social, and environmental resilience outcomes
- Cooperating with the City of Rochester and Rochester Economic Development Corporation, this inaugural panel focusing on the Bull’s Head neighborhood
- This work is supported in large part by the ULI Foundation and its members
Thank you to our sponsor!

City of Rochester
Thank you for sharing your thoughts!

- Alex Kone • Ana Liss • Anne DaSilva Tella • Baye Muhammad • Bill Carpenter •
- Bill Washington • Bret Garwood • Brian Murray • Carol Wheeler • Chadd Haskins •
- Dana Miller • Dawn Noto • Dennis Pemberton • Frank Armento • Gary Kirkmire •
- Gillian Conde • Heidi Zimmer Meyer • Holly Barrett • Joe Biondolillo • John DeMott
- John Majors • Julie Boasi • Junior Dillion • Kathy Hiltunen • Kevin Kelley •
- Kimberly Fridd • Lomax Campbell • Lorraine Collins • Marguerite Urban •
- Marvin Maye • Mary Fran Kolbruc • Mayor Lovely Warren • Melissa Geska •
- Michael Jones • Misty Dunham • Norman Jones • Patrick Crumity • Paul Scuderi •
- Rick Rynski • Shawn Burr • Simeon Banister • Thad Schofield • Tom Polech •
- Tracy Williams •
ULI Panelists and Staff

Selected for their subject matter expertise to provide **objective, volunteer** recommendations

**Paul Bernard** (Panel Chair)
Georgetown University
Columbia, MD

**Antoine Bryant**
Moody Nolan
Houston, TX

**Lawrence Cranor**
RKG Associates, Inc
Boston, MA

**Kimberly Robinson**
Pioneer Valley Planning Commission
Springfield, MA

**Ashley Jones**
Invest Atlanta
Atlanta, GA

**Bill Lashbrook III**
PNC Bank (retired)
Hopewell, NJ

**ULI Staff**
Lauren Callaghan – Director, Advisory Services
David Zehr – Senior Associate, Advisory Services
Key Acknowledgements

- COVID-19 and other acute social issues have disrupted/permanently altered lives
- Recognize the negative impact of Urban Renewal policy and racial injustice
- Change is difficult (but perhaps necessary)
- Past efforts have moved the needle and there is still a long way to go
- Old thinking, old systems, and symbols may need to be challenged
- Historic legacies, such as The Underground Railroad, are powerful and potentially transformational symbols
- While our assignment is focused, there may be other larger questions to consider
- Unique opportunity to turn the corner, reinforce identity and redefine the future
Panel Assignment

- Along with recommended new residential development as part of the overall Bull’s Head redevelopment, what types of commercial goods and services would then be supported in/beneficial to this area?

- With transformative and catalytic development as a primary objective for the targeted redevelopment area, how might Bull’s Head take on a new identity within the city/region?

- Knowing the existing market challenges, what are some creative ways to successfully recruit and sustain new small/local businesses in new commercial space at Bull’s Head?
Key Recommendation Areas

- Goods and Services
- Partnership Development
- Identity
- Communication and Engagement
- Programming and Process
Setting the Stage
Where Are We?

Rochester, New York

- Founded 1834
- Between Syracuse and Buffalo
- Bisected by Genesee River
- Current population 205,000, down from 350,000 in 1950
- 30% living in poverty, 90% of students live in economically disadvantaged homes

Bull’s Head Targeted Redevelopment Area (12 Acres)
- Just ¾ of mile from downtown
- Historically viewed as the western gateway to the city
- Had been the first economic center outside of downtown
- Still the locus of major traffic routes in the city

Photo Credit: City of Rochester, NY
Bull's Head Streets
How many people pass through there?

- Lots of people in cars!
- What are they doing?

Passing through

Daily Traffic Count from July 2017 Public Meeting

Source: City of Rochester, NY
Bull’s Head Residents
(orange)

- Why this area?
- Disparities in education, employment, and income levels
- Cost of housing, home values

Source: City of Rochester, NY
A new idea

Think bigger!

- We’re not asking you to build “what’s missing”.
- Not cookie cutter solutions or just replicating what’s in other parts of town.
- Land control and clearance creates opportunity.
- Idea: Expand the stakeholders, St. Mary’s Hospital, West End Methodist and Walgreen’s.
- Idea: St. Mary’s becomes a catalyst and key site for a new distributed energy community. Explore local partnerships.
Opportunities and Challenges
Questions to ULI Panel

- What types of commercial goods and services would be supported in/beneficial to this area as it redevelops?

- With transformative and catalytic development as a primary objective for the targeted redevelopment area, how might Bull’s Head take on a new identity within the city/region? What partnerships are needed to help reach this goal?

- Knowing the existing market challenges, what are some creative ways to successfully recruit and sustain new small/local businesses in new commercials space at Bull’s Head?
To incubate and nurture a community where equity is key, with more opportunities to create businesses, jobs, and housing options that reflect the choices of the community and foster a sense of belonging.
Opportunity: Open Communication
Building Relationships and Re-building Trust

- Engage with existing partners in a new way
- Build new partnerships
- Engage more voices in the conversation:
  - Youth
  - African Americans
  - People of Color
Opportunity: Thriving Economic Ecosystem

- Challenge: Lack of businesses and employment opportunities in the neighborhood
- Opportunity: Invest in workforce development and entrepreneurship programs to grow jobs, investment and services
Space and Safety

- Challenge: Space is needed and desired for many different activities, including businesses, desirable housing, jobs, recreation, and meeting space

- Opportunity: Many different spaces in neighborhood to accommodate this, including using existing buildings in a new way
  - Church as place of meeting and community discussions, arts, theater, and yoga
  - Green space for recreational opportunities, music performances, and art
  - Food trucks and festival space

- Challenge: Physical logistics of the street layout and pedestrian safety

- Opportunity: Chance to create spaces that safely allow for movement, such as walking and biking
Image and Perception

- Challenge: Public safety perception and reality, needs of the community
- Opportunity: Discussion with community on how to address safety in the area
- Larger opportunity: Solidify Bull’s Head identity, both rooted in the past and facing the future

Photo Credit: Paul Bernard
Goods and Services
Let's Take the Scenic Ride
Creating an Ecosystem for Residents and Businesses to Thrive

- Workforce Development
- Business Development
- Partnerships
- Business Curation
- Experiential Destination
- Collective Vision
- Wealth Creation
- Trust and Transparency

What's in it for ME??

Rochester, NY – June 2021
Community Based Programming
Advancing the Income Potential of the Current Residents

- Workforce Development Program
  - Assess residents’ current basic needs
  - Secure occupational skill training
  - Secure higher paying jobs
  - Continue to provide post-secondary educational opportunities
  - Secure livable wage and high demand career employment

- Entrepreneurship Program
  - Networking with likeminded individuals
  - Access to capital-risk tolerant lenders/ equity sources
  - Place to work- coffee and community, workspaces, mentorship, job boards
  - Community led solution discussions

Laying the foundation for a skilled workforce creates attractiveness for new employers

Source Material: The Urban League
Partnerships

Building the Table Prior To The Meal

- **Corporate** - How does the University of Rochester and St. Mary's Hospital view this community through investment within the community? How do they view diversity procurement specifically for this community and its businesses?

- **Philanthropic** - How do the local foundations view the business needs for this community?

- **Educational** - What programs exist and need to be formed to upskill the current resident base? Creating career opportunities for residents from all educational and skill levels.

- **Cultural/Art** - Is cultural preservation a necessity here? If so, who are the partners to help administer those programs?
Scaling Local Businesses
Meeting the Community’s Lifestyle Needs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Healthy Food</th>
<th>Health and Wellness</th>
<th>Entertainment/Art</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grocery (Good Food Markets)</td>
<td>Primary Care</td>
<td>Live Music</td>
<td>Technical/Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coffee/ Grab and Go (Livie's Jamaican Restaurant &amp; Import Market)</td>
<td>Dentist</td>
<td>Amphitheatre</td>
<td>Small Business Capacity Building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sit-down (Chili Diner)</td>
<td>Fitness</td>
<td>Community Garden</td>
<td>University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yoga</td>
<td>Art Studios</td>
<td>Daycare/Headstart</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Kicks & Caps has 26,000 Instagram Followers!
How do we scale this local business to the next level?
Case Study: Pearl
San Antonio, TX

- Objective: To transform an abandoned historic site, and surrounding neighborhood, into a vibrant historic adaptive re-use destination

- Determine best uses and designs for indoor and outdoor buildings and open spaces to maximize the site’s potential as a community gathering spot and revenue generator.

- Outcome: Made a commitment to stewardship and learning. Home to the Culinary Institute of America, San Antonio, (CIA) restaurants, a farmers’ market and food events coexist with bike stores, children’s bookstores and health clubs.

- Educational: Culinary Institute of America Texas Campus
  - Founded in 1946, CIA provides the world’s best culinary education to future leaders of the food world, with bachelor’s, master’s, and associate degrees.
  - The CIA Texas campus in San Antonio is home to a diverse and energetic community of food lovers who have a special interest in Latin cuisine.

- Public Amenities
  - amphitheater, sculpture garden, public plaza, multi-use grass park, arts and craft passageway, wedding garden and open-air dining areas

Source: https://mjmmg.com/pearl-brewery-case-study/
Bull’s Head Identity
Bull’s Head Identity, In the Region and the City

“…I wanna be where you are...ARE....”

- **Definition of amenities as decidedly ‘Bull’s Head’** – can we align the major anchors as a part of the Bull’s Head legacy. Create a more distinct relationship between St. Mary’s Hospital, among others.

- **Establish strong, symbiotic relationships with the private sector** – There are significant and distinct advantages to working with St. Mary’s Hospital, as well as with the University of Rochester. Jointly working to uplift the future of Bull’s Head, will go a long way toward creating energy and enthusiasm in the area.
Definition of physical indicators – successful definition of identity involves easily recognized signs of culture. These could include but are not limited to: signage; inlaid brick pavers at crosswalks; gateway elements; lighting fixtures; color palette; natural vegetation; defined street furniture; proliferation of the Bull’s Head logo.

Ensure culture and various backgrounds remain integral to the identity of Bull’s Head: We must ensure that the inherent community culture is reflected in the identity. There will need to be critical reconciliation of inequity, if there will be holistic embracing of the Bull’s Head identity.
Bull’s Head Identity, In the Region and the City

- **Nurture local entrepreneurs** – often the best ways to grow the brand of a specific area is by empowering the very residents within. There has been consistent recognition of local entrepreneurs that are successful and growing that would benefit by the ability to remain in Bull’s Head. Additionally, the provision of small business capital, as well as ‘white box’ opportunities for business incubation could further serve to build the Bull’s Head brand.

- **Must establish ‘opportunity’ programs,** repositioning Bull’s Head into place of hope – that will serve to invigorate the populace, and ideally strengthen skill sets.
Community Engagement

“...Got to give us what we want, Gotta give us what we need...”

▪ Vary the physical location(s) of engagement – Outreach efforts at St. Mary’s seems to have garnered significant response. However, additional value could be derived by varying the location, or more importantly, going where the people already congregate. This will garner even greater diversity of respondents, ensuring more comprehensive engagement.

▪ Ensure residents of Bull’s Head, or those with active relationships, participate – Many engagement methods allow for anyone to participate. This can be productive but skews the results. Establish protocols to guarantee targeted participation of specific residents.

▪ Clarify outgoing messaging, and express hope – All parties within the City need to be speaking with one voice.
Community Engagement

- “...I believe that children are the future...”: Aggressively target younger audiences – if we are truly looking toward the future, it is imperative that we include our next generation in the discussion.

- “...hey now! What’s you IG?”: Consistent, active web presence – To ensure we are as inclusive and responsive as possible, we must create an active, live, social media presence. We cannot rely only on a web site; we will need to diversify our virtual presence, and update regularly (IG, Twitter, TikTok, other). This will encourage even greater participation, as well as updates in real time.

- Work together for shared vision: The very premise of engagement involved active listening and is two-way communication. Hence, the vision for Bull’s Head should be community-driven and consensus-directed.
Community Engagement

- **Wed Engagement to Implementation**: If the community has been consistently meeting for an extensive amount of time, there must be action tied to those efforts. To encourage and spread enthusiasm, couple planning efforts with the recognition of wins, so that the community can see the fruits of their labor. This will effectively combat planning fatigue.

- **Employ a High Tech/High Touch Model**: In an increasingly tech-driven world, we cannot place the onus of engagement on technology. Neither can we exclusively exist in an in-person silo and rely upon the gathering space as a primary means of engagement. Maximize the potential of both methods of engagement, thereby garnering the greatest community response.

- **Pittsburgh Yards**
Priorities and Implementation
Much of the narrative and analysis throughout this process addresses the need to develop policies, programs and metrics for furthering both the social and economic investment potential and opportunities throughout the Bull’s Head neighborhood.

Recommended inclusionary social and economic initiatives specifically targeted to the resident population to ensure that their vision of the future is adequately represented, but as importantly, that they have the necessary tools and opportunities to be an integral part of the transformative economic change, as opposed to just recipients of that change.

However, at the end of the day, and reflective of the above, the question remains – “what is the physical, or built-environment, within the identified 12-acre land assemblage (Site) and what are the necessary elements of an Implementation Strategy to get there?”

Consider the Implementation Strategy as if the Site were its own master plan process, identifying broad goals or initiatives with specific objectives and action items – assigning accountability, defining timelines (urgency) and offering some metric for measuring success.
Bull’s Head Development Plan - Implementation

Goal – Community Outreach and General Communication Process

- **Objective 1** - Effectively establish a process to further community engagement, outreach and overall marketing of the Bull's Head Development Plan and/or Considered Initiatives

- **Objective 2** - Integration of related parties/entities to the process - hospitals, churches, non-profits throughout the immediate community and greater Rochester.

- **Objective 3** - Provide a physical presence in the neighborhood for collection and dissemination all information. It is important that the resident population “see” a near-term project come to fruition. Consider re-positioning a portion of the Bull’s Head Plaza, and associated parking area, as such an initial kick-start project – the Bull’s Head Community Resource Center.
Objective 4 – Further identify and refine the desired basic goods and services to serve the local community. Consider a targeted outreach to area residents to garner their input and vision. This may have an additional bonus of identifying most desired components (by tally count) and assist in the next step efforts which include bringing the vision to developers.

What we have heard to date – neighborhood convenience grocery and fresh food options, health care and service options, arts/entertainment, professional services (banking) and education and personal services (day care).

Objective 5 – Identify unique destination retail which can bring a larger consumer audience to the Bull’s Head neighborhood and improve the “after five-o’clock” economic vitality and multi-destination consumer activity.

What we have heard to date – dining and drinking venues with a focus to multi-cultural cuisines – locally owned and operated and gathering space for arts, entertainment and related venues.
Bull’s Head Development Plan - Implementation

Goal – Considerations in Defining the “Program and Process” for the 12-acre Site

- **Site Ownership** – Continued City ownership allows for site control, now and in the future and may afford a menu of financial and other development incentives to the private sector.

- **Determine buildable parameters of the Site** – Some acreage will be required for access and interior arterials. Some acreage should be set aside as public space. Zoning may dictate eventual building footprint capacity.

- **Preliminary Site Conceptualization** – Realize the importance of street facing storefronts with wide sidewalk, landscaping and pedestrian amenities – an issue of scale and accessibility.

- **Parking Capacities** – Consider centralized parking to the extent possible, or shared parking opportunities (in the rear of building) – the goal is an appropriate scale of development without a sea of surface parking.

Image Credit: City of Rochester, Esri
Bull’s Head Development Plan - Implementation

Goal – Define the “Program and Process” for the 12-acre Site (continued)

- **Key parcels** – Phasing of the development is crucial, first in determining locations for desired goods and services and their footprints, and second, the capacity to influence future development of more interior, locations.

- **Plan for the future** – As other parcels in the Bull’s Head neighborhood become available consider City acquisition and land banking – possible assemblage for future residential and/or public space development.

- **Clearly define workable developer agreement(s)** – What is expected from the public sector? What is expected from the private sector? What can each bring to the table? How can the approval and permitting process be as ‘vanilla’ as possible?

- **Consider an ongoing steering committee** – City, community, and other stakeholder representation along with development community (developer, brokers, realtors) – to continue to move the efforts forward.

- **Realize that not all built environment needs to be a brick-and-mortar space** – Allow for open air and/or seasonal market space, pop-ups, incubator space and the like

- **Rebranding Bull’s Head** – Accentuate the look and feel and sense of place throughout the neighborhood – include historic markers and wayfinding to the extent possible.
# Bull’s Head Development Plan - Implementation

## Format Example of an Implementation Matrix

### Bull's Head - Rochester, New York

**Strategic Neighborhood Development - Implementation Matrix**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective #4</th>
<th>Implementation Lead</th>
<th>Implementation Timing (Year)</th>
<th>Estimated Cost</th>
<th>Measuring Success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Public/NP</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 1:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 2:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 3:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective #5</th>
<th>Implementation Lead</th>
<th>Implementation Timing (Year)</th>
<th>Estimated Cost</th>
<th>Measuring Success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Public/NP</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 1:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 2:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 3:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective #6</th>
<th>Implementation Lead</th>
<th>Implementation Timing (Year)</th>
<th>Estimated Cost</th>
<th>Measuring Success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Public/NP</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 1:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 2:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action 3:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Are there new social methods to enhance communication, partnerships and scalable results?
Collective Impact is a way of working collaboratively to solve complex/adaptive problems
Successful collective impact initiatives typically have five conditions:
- Common agenda
- Shared measurement systems
- Mutually reinforcing activities
- Continuous communication
- Backbone support organizations
Rochester Collective Impact examples include:
- Connected Communities
- Roc the Future
Additional Planning and Engagement Tools

GIS District Mapping Tools

- Expand the use of current mapping functionality to include:
  - Interactive evaluation capabilities
  - Reporting and performance tracking
  - Outreach and communication
  - Idea exchange (community and intergovernmental)

- Work with existing or new service provider to explore new functionalities
Final Thoughts
Thank you!
http://www.uli.org/advisoryservices